In the Matter of:

Jonathan R., et al.,

VS

JIM JUSTICE, et al.

DANIELLE COX

December 08, 2023



5010 Dempsey Drive Cross Lanes WV 25313 304-415-1122

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA AT HUNTINGTON

JONATHAN R., et al.,

Plaintiffs,

-vs- Case No. 3:19-cv-00710

JIM JUSTICE, in his official capacity as Governor of West Virginia, et al.,

Defendants.

DEPOSITION OF DANIELLE COX

The deposition of Danielle Cox was taken on December 8, 2023, at 9:00 a.m., at 2116 Kanawha Boulevard, East, Charleston, West Virginia.

ELITE COURT REPORTING, LLC 5010 Dempsey Drive Cross Lanes, West Virginia 25313 (304) 415-1122

Tara Arthur, CCR

Page 2 1 APPEARANCES 2 Richard W. Walters J. Alexander Meade 3 Ryan Walters Attorneys at Law 4 Shaffer & Shaffer, PLLC P.O. Box 3973 5 Charleston, West Virginia 25339-3973 6 Julia Tebor 7 Lindsay Gus Attorneys at Law A Better Childhood 355 Lexington Avenue, Floor 16 9 New York, New York 10017 (Participated via Zoom) 10 11 Marty Mazezka Attorney at Law Disability Rights of West Virginia 12 1207 Quarrier Street, Suite 400 Charleston, West Virginia 25301 13 14 Caroline M. Brown 15 Attorney at Law Brown & Piesch, PLLC 16 1233 20th Street NW, Suite 505 Washington, DC 20001 17 18 Steven R. Compton Attorney at Law 19 West Virginia Attorney General's Office 812 Quarrier Street, Second Floor 20 Charleston, West Virginia 25301 (Participated via Zoom) 21 22 23 24

_				
1	APPEARANCES (Cont'd)	Page 3		
2				
3	Jennelle H. Jones Attorney at Law WVOT			
4	Department of Administration Building 1, Room E119			
5	1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East Charleston, West Virginia 25305			
6				
7	Chris Ross Attorney at Law			
8	Pullin Fowler Flanagan Brown & Poe			
9	901 Quarrier Street Charleston, West Virginia 25301			
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				

0			
1	I N D E X		Page 4
2	WITNESS		
3	Danielle Cox		
4	EXAMINATION		
5	by Mr. Walters by Ms. Brown	Page 05 Page 90	
6	by Mr. Walters		
7	EXHIBITS		
8	Number 1 Number 2	Page 22 Page 36	
9	Number 3 Number 4	Page 39 Page 41	
10	Number 5 Number 6	Page 51 Page 60	
11	Number 7 Number 8	Page 78 Page 78	
12	Number 9 Number 10	Page 82 Page 87	
13	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	2	
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21	Reporter's Certificate: Errata Sheet/Signature Page:	Page 95 Enclosed	
22			
23			
24			

Page 5 1 DANIELLE COX, 2 called as a witness, first being duly sworn by the Court Reporter/Notary Public, 3 testified as follows, to wit: 5 EXAMINATION BY MR. WALTERS: 6 7 Good morning, Ms. Cox. My name is 8 Rich Walters. We met earlier. I represent 9 the plaintiffs in the matter against DHHR. 10 Could you please state your name, 11 please? 12 Danielle Cox. A. 13 Ms. Cox, what's your current title? Q. 14 Chief information security officer. Α. Where are you currently employed? 15 Q. 16 A. Office of Technology, Department of Admin. 17 18 For the State of West Virginia? Q. 19 A. Yes. 20 What is your role in that position? 21 I am responsible for the integrity, availability and security of state data and 22 23 systems. 24 Q. How long have you been the chief

Page 6 information officer? 1 2 Since around 2019. 3 Q. What was your position prior to 2019? 4 5 A. Security analyst manager. With the same department? 6 0. 7 A. Yep. How long have you been with the 8 Q. 9 West Virginia Office of Technology? 10 Eleven, 12 years. A. 11 Walk me through that. What did you Q. 12 start as? 13 I started as an analyst, what's Α. 14 called an Information Security Officer I. 15 And then promoted to manager, and then applied for CISO when that became available. 16 And the Information Officer I, what 17 18 is their role? What do they do? 19 A. You are doing the base -- you know, the basic work. So typically, we do analyst 20 21 -- threat hunting, audits, compliance, 22 regulations, policy writing. We help with 23 some of our services, that type of stuff. 24 Q. What are your services? What does

Page 7 1 the West Virginia Office of Technology do? 2 So the Office of Technology as a whole, or my office -- my team? 3 Let's start with the office as a 4 5 whole. 6 Α. Okay. 7 And then we will break it down Q. 8 by --9 The office as a whole is a service A. 10 provider for executive branch agencies. we do -- West Virginia is a consolidated IT 11 12 department, meaning shared services, things 13 like email, network, security, things that 14 are better from a cost estimate, better --15 if you get the bulk, you get that price 16 deal. So that's the services we provide is 17 on those areas. Server management data 18 center. 19 Q. You said for the executive branch? 20 Yes. Α. What about the rest of the state 21 agencies? 22 23 Non-executive branch? A. 24 Q. Yes.

Page 8 1 They do what they want. A. 2 Oh, okay. So they have their own servers, their own computer systems, their 3 4 own systems? 5 Yeah -- well, education would be A. 6 the other biggest entity. Executive branch is the -- a lot. 7 8 All right. Q. 9 Legislative, judicial, they are all -- they do whatever they -- no visibility 10 11 into their systems. 12 When you refer to executive branch, that includes DHHR, correct? 13 14 A. Yes. Main departments. 15 Is that the largest department that Q. 16 you all service? 17 Yes. Α. 18 Okay. And what are the divisions 0. 19 -- you mentioned that there was different --20 I want to say divisions or components of 21 WVOT, is that what you are referred WVOT. 22 to as? 23 We call ourselves OT -- WVOT, yeah. 24 Q. What are those? Are they

Elite Court Reporting, LLC DANIELLE COX, 12/08/2023

Page 9 1 divisions? Are they -- how do you define 2 them? We have -- well, mine is set as an 3 4 office simply because of the legislative 5 code that establishes my office. there's the PMO office - project management 6 We have an operations team, which 7 8 is boots on the ground, break/fix type 9 stuff. We have an engineering team. We have all of our admin type services, which 10 11 would be billing, HR, that type of stuff. And then we have Enterprise services, which 12 13 is everything from specialty applications to 14 like Enterprise architecture, planning. 15 Q. The first one you mentioned, the 16 PMO --Project management office, yes. 17 A. 18 -- what do they do? Q. They are the office that helps 19 Α. 20 basically work with the business and kind of 21 try to connect the technology and the 22 business needs. We are a hundred percent 23 charge-back service. They do have to pay for that service. And they submit plans. 24

Page 10 1 And we get the state folders together, 2 assign a project manager and make sure they are not resourced -- one agency is not 3 resourced draining from a shared pool of 4 5 resources essentially. Only so many --They actually don't play fair. 6 0. Yeah. Only so many IT people to go 7 8 around. 9 Right. Q. 10 All right. I jumped ahead of Let me back up. Tell me a little 11 myself. 12 bit about your educational background. I have a dual major in IT in 13 Α. 14 business management. 15 0. From? University of Charleston. 16 I have a master's degree from 17 18 Marshall in technology management with a focus in cyber security. And then I have a 19 20 couple of certificates. I am -- most 21 professional certificates, the CISSP. 22 0. When did you get your IT degree at 23 UC? 2004, 2005. And I think the 24 Α.

Page 11

- 1 master's degree was probably 2012.
- Q. Oh, long after I did my computer
- 3 work at UC. It wasn't even called IT back
- 4 then.
- 5 A. Yeah. No, they paid me to go to UC
- 6 because of their IT.
- 7 Q. A minor in something, information
- 8 services or -- no.
- 9 A. Yeah. That's what they used to
- 10 call it.
- 11 Q. Is that what it was?
- 12 A. Information -- yeah. They used to
- 13 call that --
- 14 Q. I think I learned COBOL.
- 15 A. Oh. No, thank you.
- 16 Q. Yeah. At least I was past the
- 17 punch cards.
- 18 A. That was in the history books.
- 19 Q. Yeah, I understand.
- MR. ROSS: We just went into
- 21 nerd territory.
- Q. Prior to coming to work for the
- 23 state -- or Office of Technology, where did
- 24 you work at?

Page 12 1 A. I was a training director for 2 Bowles Rice. I taught attorneys how to use technology because they couldn't. 3 4 Yeah. Lucky you. Q. 5 Α. Yeah. All right. Obviously we are here 6 0. 7 today about the issues with the DHHR, the litigation hold and those matters. When it 8 9 comes to preserving email accounts for DHHR 10 employees specifically, which department would that fall under as far as monitoring 11 12 -- let's start with as far as maintaining 13 them? 14 I --Α. 15 Which of your departments that you 16 described for me would that be under, or how did that work? 17 18 So typically, the work flow -- the work flow is -- it comes in to our office --19

- 20 my office specifically. It comes in to my
- 21 analysts. We have a single point for that
- 22 for all of the agencies just so we don't
- 23 miss as many as humanly possible. And it
- 24 gets tasked out to analysts to do X, Y and

Page 13

- 1 Z. So if we get provided an account, we
- 2 assign it to accounts management to have
- 3 switches flipped or put it in whatever
- 4 bucket it needs to be. Or if we need to do
- 5 searches, then our analysts typically do the
- 6 searches.
- 7 Q. Okay. And you're talking
- 8 specifically about litigation holds, right?
- 9 A. Yes. Accounts, yeah.
- 10 Q. Explain to me how the email system
- 11 works. For instance, DHHR has obviously
- 12 thousands of employees and they all have
- 13 emails?
- 14 A. You mean the email flow process?
- 15 Q. Yes.
- 16 A. Okay. So the individuals at DHHR,
- 17 whoever is responsible for a particular
- 18 employee -- if they are getting a new
- 19 employee or an employee is leaving, we have
- 20 forms in our work flow system. It's called
- 21 Ivanti. They submit the request for a new
- 22 account. That account -- they provide all
- 23 of the information that is needed. That
- 24 account gets created. When the employee

Page 14 1 starts, that start date, they can go log in 2 with the information and get their account. 3 The opposite is true. When they go 4 to leave, the supervisor drops an email --5 not an email, drops a form. It tasks it out to the technicians. And the system starts 7 the automatic deprovision process. 8 we get ten to 15 of those at least a day. 9 And so it goes through and it sees, 10 okay, who is getting access to the email for 11 the next 30 days, copies over everything for 12 them to have access to, gives them access to 13 the email. And then it will close unless an 14 agency is requested an extension or 15 something. 16 Okay. Going back to the creation 17 of the email accounts. Does that go through 18 your office? 19 My specific team? Α. 20 Q. Yes. 21 No. 22 Who does that go through? Q. 23 It goes through accounts 24 management.

Page 15 1 0. Accounts management? 2 Which is part of operations. A. Yeah. 3 Okay. Thanks. Q. 4 So when a request comes in to 5 create a new email account for a state employee, they provide the information, do 6 7 they -- as far as access to that particular account, is that something that is set up by 8 9 you, or is that automatic? How does it work as far as who has access besides the 10 individual it is being set up for? 11 12 Just the individual that has -- I 13 mean, obviously admin control has access. But no, just them. Unless it is specified 14 15 for some reason. 16 Okay. So as far as a regular email account, your admin department would have 17 access to it, but nobody else would have 18 19 access to that email other than that individual unless it was specifically 20 21 requested? 22 Yeah. And there is actually 23 a form for that. But that never happens, 24 like when an account is created.

Page 16 1 It never happens or something that 0. happens that somebody is going to say, make 2 sure I have access to this account when you 3 create it? 4 Yeah. It doesn't happen. 5 Α. They could, but they don't? 6 Q. They could, but they don't. 7 Usually that is like after the account 8 9 creation. When there is -- an issue arises? 10 Yeah. Or need help -- admins get 11 12 assigned, that type of thing, for like secretaries and things. 13 14 Right. Q. 15 Okay. You just mentioned -- when you were walking me through that process, 16 you mentioned the deprovisioning. So let's 17 talk about that a little bit. When your 18 19 office is notified that an account needs to 20 be deprovisioned -- first of all, tell me 21 why that would happen. 22 Separation of employment is the 23 number one. I mean, they are fired, they 24 are leaving, they are transferring.

Page 17

- 1 Especially with like a large agency like
- 2 DHHR, they change agencies. That's pretty
- 3 much it.
- Q. What about if there has been a --
- 5 what's the word I want -- at one period of
- 6 time there has been no activity?
- 7 A. No activity? So the no activity is
- 8 a little different. After 30 days of no
- 9 activity, the account goes into a locked
- 10 status. And then 30 days after that, then
- 11 it can get deleted. We have a form for --
- 12 like if somebody is going to be on sick
- 13 leave or maternity leave, something like
- 14 that, we have a form so we know that those
- 15 accounts shouldn't be shut. That's a
- 16 security practice that is standard. It's in
- 17 this state 152 or 53 standard to terminate
- 18 those account -- access.
- 19 Q. So if somebody goes on extended
- 20 leave and you don't receive notification
- 21 within 60 days, it's going to be taken out?
- 22 A. Yeah.
- Q. That's not the word I want. It is
- 24 going to be deleted.

Page 18 That's fine. 1 A. 2 Specifically in your department, talk to me a little bit about the hierarchy. 3 4 Who do you report to? Chief information officer - CIO. 5 And who is that? 6 Q. 7 Currently, it's Heather Abbott. 8 How long has Ms. Abbott been there? Q. 9 In that position, three months --Α. 10 three months. 11 And who was in that position prior 12 to Ms. Abbott? 13 A. Josh Spence. I'm sorry? 14 Q. 15 Α. Josh Spence. 16 Josh Spence? Q. 17 Uh-huh. A. 18 How long was Mr. Spence in that 19 position? 20 Four years. Α. 21 Do you supervise any individuals Q. 22 directly? 23 Α. Yes. 24 How many? Q.

Page 19 There's ten people on my team right 1 A. 2 I directly supervise the two managers. Who are the two managers? 3 Q. 4 Matt Winfree and Leroy Amos. 5 THE COURT REPORTER: What was the last name? 6 7 THE WITNESS: Amos. 8 THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you. 9 Q. What was the last name of the first 10 one? 11 Winfree. A. 12 Q. Winfree? 13 A. Yeah. 14 And so you have two managers. Q. And 15 underneath each manager, there's four 16 employees? Sometimes we -- one guy gets 17 Yes. 18 kicked. But yes. 19 Q. And what do these employees -- the 20 ten employees under you, what are their 21 purposes, or what are they made to do? A. So on Winfree's side of the house, 22 23 he is responsible for security 24 administration, security planning and

Page 20 1 compliance and control. So he is 2 essentially the team that tries to prevent 3 the attacks by keeping the infrastructure up-to-date by running like vulnerability 5 scans and pentesting stuff and making sure 6 that the hackers can't easily get in. 7 And then on Leroy's side of the 8 team is where all of our forensics, 9 investigations, threat hunting and security 10 operations, which would include firewall 11 advanced and point detection. 12 Which team would be responsible for 13 the litigation holds? 14 The forensic team. Α. 15 Mr. Amos at this point? 16 Yeah. I mean, there's a couple of 17 them. He was our primary for a while, yeah. 18 How long has he been a manager Q. 19 under you? 20 A. Amos? 21 0. Yes. 22 Or Leroy? A. 23 Q. It's Leroy Amos? 24 Leroy Amos, yeah. Sorry. A.

```
Page 21
                Leroy has been a manager under me
 1
 2
     since I took over. So four years.
 3
              Okay. And --
           Q.
 4
               He has been on the team a while
 5
     though.
 6
           Q.
               I'm sorry?
 7
               He has been on the team a while.
           A.
 8
               How long has he been there?
           Q.
 9
           A.
               (Laughs.)
               Long time?
10
           Q.
11
           A.
               Yeah. He retires in two years.
12
     Okay? Let's just put it that way.
13
               Lucky man.
           Q.
               He is not allowed.
14
15
               Is his team also responsible for
           Q.
16
     deprovisioning?
17
           A.
               No.
18
           Q.
               Who does that?
19
           Α.
               Accounts management. It's more of
20
21
               Oh, okay.
           Q.
22
               It's more automated. Because we
           A.
23
     have 20,000 users.
24
           Q. Right.
```

Page 22 1 So it's not a very hands --Α. 2 hands-on process. 3 0. They receive the document and process it? 4 5 A. Yeah. (Exhibit 1 was marked.) 6 7 All right. Ms. Cox, I am going to hand you what's been marked as Deposition 8 Exhibit Number 1. 9 10 Yeah. Α. 11 I'll give you a second. And my 12 first question is going to be, what is it? 13 This is a printout, which I have A. 14 never actually seen, of our Ivanti service 15 request for a deprovision. 16 So when we were talking about the 17 requests that you receive to deprovision an employee's email, this is the document that 18 19 we are referring to? 20 A. Yes. 21 And this is a two-page screenshot of that electronically submitted form, 22 23 correct? 24 Α. Yes.

```
Page 23
 1
               Because when you all receive it,
           Q.
 2
     it's just an electronic --
 3
           A.
               Yeah.
               -- format --
           0.
 5
           A.
               Yeah.
 6
           Q.
               -- right?
 7
               All right. For the record, it said
     WVOT 0014 and 0015.
 8
 9
               All right. I am going to have you
10
     walk me through this. The first thing I got
11
     up top is Service Request 116774. Is that
12
     just the number -- sequential number of --
13
           A.
               Yeah. It's the 116,000, yeah.
14
               How long has this service been --
           Q.
15
     or this process been in place?
16
               On this system, three years.
17
               Okay. So is it fair to say that in
     three years, we deprovisioned 116,000
18
19
     employees?
20
               No. Because a service request can
     be something else. But it would -- it's a
21
22
     large number.
23
           Q.
               Got you.
24
           A.
               Turnovers average at least 400 a
```

Page 24 1 month. 2 All right. Customer, Beth Jarrett. 3 Do you know who Ms. Jarrett is? 4 Bill Crouch's admin -- or the main 5 admin for DHHR. O. Who is the individual that 6 7 typically makes the deprovisioning requests? 8 Whatever the agency decides. Α. 9 have no input on that one. The agency has 10 agreed upon who can submit them. And we 11 honor that request. 12 You're just doing what they tell 13 you to? 14 Yeah. We are a service provider. 15 And the account -- so this goes to Q. 16 somebody in account management? 17 Yeah. It goes to a team, and Α. whoever picks it up. 18 19 And if you look at the right-hand 20 side there, it says, Team: Enterprise -21 Account Management. Is Enterprise the name 22 of a team? What is Enterprise? 23 Enterprise means --Α. 24 The Enterprise? Q.

Page 25 -- the Enterprise, yeah. 1 Α. 2 The service request details, middle 3 of the page, comments there, "Remove a user's current network access when 5 transferring or completely remove access when leaving." 6 7 Is that something that is typed in 8 by Ms. Jarrett? Is that a standard 9 filled-in box? What is that? 10 A. That is a security reminder for the 11 people that are performing tasks. I don't 12 want them to forget to do stuff. So we can build in little reminders on the floor. 13 14 Q. So that comment is something -- if 15 I were working for DHHR, I pull up this 16 deprovisioning form --17 They never see that. Α. 18 Q. Oh, they don't see that? No. 19 Α. That's on our side. 20 So that is something that is 0. 21 already there, put in there by you or 22 somebody on your team to remind them of what 23 they are doing? 24 Yes. That's basically what the A.

Page 26

- 1 service is.
- Q. Right. And then below that,
- 3 created by Beth Jarrett. And then it says,
- 4 On December 30, 2022, 1:16:29 -- would that
- 5 be the date that the service request was
- 6 created or submitted?
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. Is there a distinction between the
- 9 two? I don't imagine it takes too long to
- 10 do this. But if they start doing it at a
- 11 certain time, would this be when it was
- 12 submitted or when they started filling out
- 13 the form?
- A. So it was -- when the form was
- 15 created by was when the form was created.
- 16 And then the date is when the -- it was
- 17 done. They put down here when it was like
- 18 supposed to be done. The agency provides
- 19 us --
- 20 Q. The effective date?
- 21 A. -- the effective date. So when the
- 22 actual thing gets in place -- this internal
- 23 services responded by, that's when the
- 24 technician like closed the task.

Page 27 1 Q. Okay. 2 Which is -- that's an internal A. 3 thing to OT. That's not really a --4 And I want to ask you about Right. 0. 5 So when it says internal services, January 20th, 2023 -- so 20 days after this 6 was created, it was -- the internal services 7 responded or closed it. What does that mean 8 9 by closing it? So internal services for this 10 11 system means that it was automatically 12 closed, that everything -- all of the tasks 13 had been completed and that they had been closed, and it doesn't stay open in our 14 15 queue of list of work we need to do. 16 Q. Okay. Because like each team has like a 17 Α. 18 giant list of work to get completed. 19 Q. Okay. Then on the left-hand side, 20 I got parameters. Is that information that 21 is in --22 That's what the agency provides us. Α. So that's information that 23 Q. 24 Ms. Jarrett would have inputted into the

Page 28 particular fillable form? 1 2 A. Yes. 3 And I am correct, this is a Q. fillable form that they fill out when they 5 are doing it? 6 A. Yes. 7 So you have got her email, the 8 reason for the request, which she was 9 leaving employment -- employee's email, 10 which is what we are deprovisioning, 11 correct --12 Α. (Nods head.) 13 -- and then what department? Q. 14 Now, the effective date, that is --15 again, I think that's what you told me is 16 what Ms. Jarrett put in as to when they want this to be effective? 17 Yeah. 18 Α. 19 Q. When they want the email access cut off? 20 21 Yeah. Α. 22 "Does the person have FACT access?" Q. 23 Now, does that black circle with the X mean 24 yes or no?

Page 29 1 A. I am going to go with no. Well --2 I don't know is also an acceptable 3 answer. 4 Yeah. It might be I don't know. Α. We will go with I don't know. The nerd in 5 6 me says it's no. 7 But you are not sure? 8 A. Yeah, no. 9 The next question, "Would you like 10 someone to access this person's email? 11 so, select the person here." 12 You have got an ID number and an 13 email. What does that do? 14 A. That gives the mailbox -- that 15 gives Ms. Jarrett access to that mailbox for 16 30 days. 17 So once the request is put in, 18 whoever puts the request in has the option 19 of putting in an email address to an 20 individual that will have access to that 21 account for the next 30 days? 22 Α. Yes. 23 And in this case, Ms. Jarrett had 24 access to Mr. Crouch's email address from

Page 30 1 approximately December 30, 2022, till 2 January 30, 2023? 3 Α. Yes. 0. Dates are hard for me. 5 The next one is email substitute. 6 What does that mean? 7 That means when somebody --8 basically, when you -- she's going to take 9 over emails. So after where it has got like 10 an away message, it is going to start 11 sending the messages to her so she can cover 12 the work, like what comes in, so she can 13 respond. 14 All right. Thank you. And that's Q. 15 my fault. I skipped one. 16 Α. Yeah. 17 There is a message there that says, 18 "If you would like an auto reply on this 19 person's email, please type the auto reply 20 here." 21 So that's something that Ms. 22 Jarrett typed in to say --23 Uh-huh. A. 24 Q. -- for the -- for how long is that

Page 31 1 in place? 2 Thirty days. A. 3 Okay. So for the next 30 days, if Q. an email goes to Mr. Crouch's email, they 4 5 are going to get this response, and it is 6 going to kick it to the substitute email? 7 Yes. Α. The next one is, "Please enter name 8 0. 9 of the person you would like to access this person's MyDrive file." 10 What's a MyDrive file? 11 12 It is the -- MyDrive is the Google version of OneDrive. So it's the Cloud 13 14 version of your document management system. 15 Q. The actual hard drive -- well --No. 16 17 It is not a hard drive? Q. 18 A. It is Cloud documentation. If you 19 use Microsoft, you use OneDrive, right? 20 Q. Right. 21 Google has MyDrive. Α. 22 Okay. So it's the access to that Q. 23 particular employee's drive that contains 24 theoretically all of the documents --

Page 32 1 In the Cloud. Α. 2 -- they have stored on it in the 3 Cloud? 4 In the Cloud, yes. 5 How long does that person Q. Okay. 6 have access to MyDrive? Is that indefinite? 7 It copies it. A. 8 Okay. So it actually copies it to Q. 9 that person's drive as well? How does that do that? 10 11 It comes in to a folder -- yeah. 12 Okay. So inside Ms. Jarrett's 0. 13 drive, there will be a subfolder that has 14 Bill Crouch's MyDrive files? 15 Yeah. A. 16 Q. Okay. And that is -- that doesn't go away, correct? 17 18 No. Α. 19 Q. What's DAA? 20 Designated approval authority. A. 21 So that's Ms. Jarrett advising your 22 account management team that she has the authority to do this? 23 24 A. Yes.

Page 33 1 (A discussion was held off the 2 record.) 3 BY MR. WALTERS: 4 Q. Does DHHR have its own independent 5 IT department? 6 A. Yes. 7 What's it called? Q. 8 Α. MIS. 9 What's the role of MIS? 0. 10 To provide customized support to A. 11 DHHR. 12 Does MIS have access to the email 0. 13 accounts as well? 14 No. They don't manage Enterprise Α. 15 They have access to like the 16 actual user's applications. They manage 17 like FACTS and RAPIDS, which are data 18 applications within DHHR. They help plan out their IT projects and stuff, that type 19 20 of thing. 21 Does your office coordinate or work Q. 22 with MIS? 23 Α. Yeah. 24 Quite a bit? Q.

Page 34 1 Α. Yeah. If MIS wanted to archive an email 2 account, how would they do it? Would they 3 4 do it through you all, or would they have 5 the ability to do it themselves? 6 They would do it through us. 7 So they would send you all a request saying we no longer have this 8 9 particular account? 10 A. Yes. What about searching MyDrives, 11 Q. 12 things like that, do they have the ability 13 to do that? Or do they have to go through 14 you all? 15 Α. That's us. Because we maintain the system. 16 So they don't have a choice 17 Okay. 18 when it comes to doing -- whether it be for 19 litigation or any other purpose, MIS doesn't 20 have their own independent access? 21 can't get into those systems? 22 Α. No. 23 Everything has to go through you Q. all? 24

Page 35 1 Right. Α. 2 And you all charge them for that, right? 3 Yes. Α. 5 Q. How does that work? Α. Hourly rate for investigations. 7 And what I am asking is, I guess --Q. Α. We charge --9 I guess really the question is, 10 why? I mean, it's all state agencies. why are there charges going back and forth? 11 12 I do security. 13 MR. ROSS: Good answer. 14 I ain't touching that one with a A. 15 20-foot pole. 16 So you all charge them an hourly rate for everything you do, or just certain 17 18 things? 19 My team has a set rate because you 20 can't opt out of security because you have 21 to have it. So we charge like per user --22 per user per month. And then anything additional that is just for a specific 23 24 office, we charge an hourly rate. Things

Page 36 like internal investigations, litigation 1 2 requests, investigations, forensics, examinations, yeah, we charge an hourly 3 4 rate. 5 Q. I am going to hand you what we will have marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 2. 6 7 (Exhibit 2 was marked.) Ms. Cox, what I've handed you 8 Q. 9 that's been marked as Deposition Exhibit 10 Number 2, it's WVOTdocs 16 and 17. This is 11 another service request for deprovisioning, 12 correct? 13 Yeah. Yes. Α. And this one is for Jeffrey Coben. 14 15 When the account management team receives a 16 request like this, whether it be Deposition Number 1 or Number 2, do they have any 17 18 obligation or any requirement to do anything 19 other than deprovisioning the account? 20 Α. No. 21 Okay. And just so we are all 22 clear, describe to me what deprovisioning 23 means.

Deprovisioning for us is just the

24

- 1 process that we go through to close out the
- 2 account, free up the user license and to
- 3 close out our association with that account
- 4 basically.
- 5 Q. So no one in your office based upon
- 6 a deprovision request like we are looking at
- 7 in Number 2, nobody in your office will be
- 8 required to go in there and view or look at
- 9 any of the emails to determine what exactly
- 10 is being deleted?
- 11 A. No. We would never do that.
- 12 Q. And I think you've already
- 13 mentioned it. But after a certain amount of
- 14 time -- well, walk me through it. Your team
- 15 receives the request?
- 16 A. Uh-huh.
- 17 Q. What do they do to trigger the
- 18 30 days? From a physical standpoint, what
- 19 do they do? They log in and do what?
- 20 A. They just log in.
- Q. And, I mean, they've got to -- tell
- 22 me what they are doing. Are they notifying
- 23 Google that we are hereby deprovisioning?
- 24 What triggers the 30-day? So they receive

- 2 A. It would be after the effective
- 3 date that's provided.
- 4 Q. What I am after here is what
- 5 exactly is the management team member doing?
- 6 When they log in to the computer system,
- 7 what are they doing? Are they hitting a
- 8 toggle, or are they sending an email? What
- 9 are they physically doing to cause this to
- 10 happen?
- 11 A. So typically what's happening is --
- 12 when the information has been requested,
- 13 they verify that the account -- the
- 14 information is good. It has got a tie-in
- 15 with another system. So they approve the
- 16 request. The access gives -- is provided to
- 17 whoever needs it. And it sets up a series
- 18 of scripts that will run at set times and
- 19 deadlines.
- Q. So they are logged in to another
- 21 system. And they indicate in that other
- 22 system this account is going to be
- 23 deprovisioned in 30 days?
- 24 A. Yeah.

Page 39 1 And somehow that gets transmitted 0. 2 to Google? 3 Yes. Scripts. Α. Is that through the scripts? 4 5 Α. Yeah. It is all automated. And once that 30 days hits, what 6 happens? What's your understanding of what 7 8 happens to the account? 9 Once the 30 days is -- it closes, 10 and there is no longer a license associated with that employee for that email address, 11 12 and those resources are freed back up. 13 (Exhibit 3 was marked.) 14 All right. I am going to hand you Q. 15 what I have marked as Deposition Exhibit 16 Number 3, which is WVOT 0034. I'll give you a second to take a look. And just basically 17 18 tell me what this is. 19 A. This is the account management procedure for basically a disabled account 20 21 process, so when an account is disabled. 22 Okay. And down at the bottom, there is a 24. Does that -- to me, that 23 24 would reflect this is page 24 of their

Page 40 1 standard procedures management policy? 2 Well, yes. Sort of. This is part of -- it's called the -- it's called the 3 Bible. 5 So the staff has a giant book of processes -- yeah. And this is the one that 6 7 was dealing with your topic. Like the one before it could have been how to deal with 8 9 fishing emails. 10 There is no rhyme or reason, it is just a collection --11 12 Α. Yeah. -- a collection of different 13 Q. 14 policies and procedures? 15 Α. It existed before me. This one apparently existed since 16 December of 2003? 17 18 Yes. Α. And it goes through -- if you look 19 Q. 20 at the top there -- the reasons why accounts 21 become disabled, employment separation, 22 security reasons. Third paragraph there,

disabled accounts will be purged after being

disabled 30 calendar days?

23

24

Page 41 Uh-huh. 1 Α. This includes home directories, 2 data sets, emails and accounts. No 3 extensions will be accepted. After 30 days, 5 accounts will be purged accordingly. 6 So that policy has been in effect 7 for at least 20 years, correct? Yeah. That was before me. 9 This particular policy, the 30-day 10 purge, is that pretty --11 Industry standard? Α. 12 Q. Yes. 13 A. Yes. Especially when dealing with Cloud documents. It's the default for both 14 15 Microsoft and Google. 16 Q. Is it pretty common knowledge in 17 your office? 18 In the technology world, yeah. A. 19 (Exhibit 4 was marked.) 20 Ms. Cox, I just handed you what's 21 been marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 4. 22 And it is an eight-page document from --WVOT 18 to WVOT 25. 23 Are you familiar with this 24

Page 42 1 document? 2 A. Yes. 3 0. Can you tell me what it is? It's our Enterprise Lifecycle 4 A. 5 Management for Google. Enterprise Lifecycle Management for 6 Google, what does that mean? 7 Lifecycle Management in IT is like 8 9 the process of when you start, you begin and 10 you end. Lifecycle? 11 Q. 12 A. Yes. Sorry. That's okay. That's why I 13 Q. wanted -- just because it says the word 14 15 doesn't necessarily mean I understand it. It's a circle. Α. 16 It's a circle? 17 Q. Α. 18 Yes. And when you say for Google -- is 19 Q. this something that was provided to you by 20 21 Google? Something you all created? Where 22 did this come from? 23 This was the update. So before --24 because we switched to Google in 2022. And

Page 43 so this is the updated version that used to 1 be for Microsoft. It's whatever our 2 Enterprise standard email tool is. 3 4 0. Got you. 5 Go to page 2 of this document. 6 the bottom, there is a section that says, Offboarding/Termination at Agency Level? 7 Α. Yeah. 8 Agency submits employee details to 9 the service desk being via an Ivanti form? 10 11 Which is -- yeah. A. 12 0. Is that Deposition Exhibit Number 1 and 2? 13 14 A. Yes. 15 So that's the Ivanti form that they 16 referred to as deprovisioning. And that 17 triggers -- the next one there says, Disable 18 account in AD. So that triggers the 19 disabling of the account --20 Α. Yes. -- which was the document we looked 21 at just a second ago? 22 23 Α. Yes. 24 Q. Okay. And then the next sentence

- 1 there says, Delegating to an executor. That
- 2 would be what we saw on the deprovisioning
- 3 form, the delegation to the executor for the
- 4 next 30 days. And in our case, for the
- 5 Deposition 1 and 2, would have been Beth
- 6 Jarrett, correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Now I want to take your attention
- 9 to -- if you go -- Bates numbers down at the
- 10 bottom is what I will refer to. Those are
- 11 the little numbers down at the bottom.
- 12 Page 21 -- or Bates number 21.
- Down at the bottom there, it says,
- 14 If user returns to work in different
- 15 department or different agency based on
- 16 policy, best practice is to start these
- 17 return users with a brand new account.
- Now, we got a bunch of redactions,
- 19 which I am not sure why we got policies
- 20 redacted. But it's -- go ahead. Is the
- 21 stuff that is redacted this stuff that shows
- 22 you how to do it?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 Q. Okay.

Page 45 It is nerd stuff that can be 1 Α. 2 backward engineered to hack systems. That's what I kind of thought. 3 Q. 4 Sorry. Α. 5 Q. No, that's good. 6 Α. You can't have it. 7 If that's what it is, I don't want Q. 8 it. 9 A. You won't understand what it says anyway. That's fine. 10 11 Right. Yeah. I took COBOL. 0. 12 It is definitely not COBOL. 13 Q. The top of the next page, "If a 14 user returns before 25 days after account 15 deletion in Google, the account can be restored." 16 17 Yes. A. First of all, let's break that 18 Q. 19 down. What's account deletion in Google? It's the removal of the license. 20 A. 21 Now, when you say account deletion, 22 is that after the 30 days, or is that -when does --23 24 It's within the 30 -- it's within Α.

- 1 the 30 days.
- Q. Okay. Because it says after
- 3 account deletion. So I am trying to figure
- 4 out from a time frame what that means. Does
- 5 it mean -- when I send in -- when your
- 6 management team submits the deprovisioning,
- 7 does that -- is that the account deletion?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. Yeah.
- 11 Q. So they are saying at that point in
- 12 time it is account deletion. So we can
- 13 recover it -- well, wouldn't they be able to
- 14 recover it within that entire 30-day period?
- 15 A. Yes. However, this is specifically
- 16 for the Google admin. If it's the next
- 17 five days, the 25 through the 30, we have to
- 18 put a request in with Google. So this is
- 19 specifically for the Google admin since this
- 20 is a document for staff to understand the
- 21 responsibilities.
- Q. When it says from Google admin,
- 23 that's something your staff has access to?
- A. Yeah. Our staff is the Google

- 1 admin.
- Q. Okay. So for the first 25 days of
- 3 that 30-day period, your staff can reinstate
- 4 the account. If it is within the frame of
- 5 25 to 30, you have to send a request to
- 6 Google?
- 7 A. Yeah. It's a very weird technical
- 8 distinction.
- 9 Q. Yeah, it is.
- 10 A. Sorry.
- 11 Q. That's all right.
- 12 If you go down to the next -- well,
- 13 the first sentence after the redaction on
- 14 the same page -- no, back on 22.
- 15 A. I know. But it was a bullet of the
- 16 previous one. So I needed to see what it
- 17 was.
- 18 Q. Got you. Sure.
- 19 You see where it says users will
- 20 remain in a suspended state until 30 days
- 21 have passed. After 30 days, admins can
- 22 delete the account in the admin panel or in
- 23 bulk using GAM.
- 24 Explain that to me, please.

- 1 A. That's some of the automated
- 2 scripting.
- Q. I guess the part that confuses me,
- 4 it says admins can delete the account. I
- 5 thought it was automatically deleted
- 6 after 30.
- 7 A. It is. And the admins are
- 8 technically doing it. So when it's
- 9 automated, you still have to assign a
- 10 responsibility to somebody from an
- 11 administrative point. So they still have to
- 12 be responsible for that automated thing.
- 13 And that's kind of what this is talking
- 14 about. It's a technical distinction. They
- 15 are not manually doing it, but they are
- 16 still responsible for it because it's their
- 17 scripts.
- 18 Q. What's the difference between the
- 19 admin delete and a bulk -- what's GAM?
- 20 A. I don't know off the top of my
- 21 head. I used to. It's a service that
- 22 basically does it.
- Q. What's the difference -- the
- 24 distinction here between a bulk deletion

- 1 versus the admin deletion? It says the
- 2 admin -- well, it says admin can do it one
- 3 of two ways, delete the account in the admin
- 4 panel or in bulk.
- 5 So I guess the question is, what's
- 6 the difference between admin panel and bulk?
- 7 A. Typically it is doing it in bulk
- 8 because that is going to be doing the
- 9 scripts. Admins -- when you are doing in
- 10 the admin panel, it is usually like one off
- 11 specific issues. Maybe you created an
- 12 account with the wrong user initial or
- 13 whatnot. And so you are having to manually
- 14 do that -- something to a specific account.
- Q. Versus having it automated?
- 16 A. Yeah. You want to try to avoid
- 17 that as much as possible, give them the
- 18 volume.
- 19 Q. And then after that 30 days -- I
- 20 don't know if you said it or not. But after
- 21 that 30 days, there is no recovery, there is
- 22 no chance?
- 23 A. No. It is gone.
- Q. It is gone.

Page 50 All right. Explain to me how --1 2 well, let's start with your understanding of 3 what a litigation hold is. A. We do what the agency requests. 4 That's what it means. 5 6 Well, yeah. But what is it? What Q. 7 is a litigation hold? For us? 8 Α. 9 0. Yes. 10 Α. We hold whatever the agency 11 requests. 12 Q. So from your standpoint, a 13 litigation hold is, you got a request from 14 an agency to preserve certain documents or certain email accounts? 15 16 Certain email accounts, yes. And from your standpoint, do you 17 care whether it is a litigation hold or just 18 19 a request to hold the email account? 20 Α. No. 21 So you're just getting a request 0. 22 from an agency --23 I have technicians, yeah. Α. 24 -- don't delete these accounts? Q.

- 1 You don't care why?
- 2 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. And is there a particular
- 4 form that the agency is supposed to use when
- 5 requesting that?
- 6 A. There is now. We have worked on
- 7 one recently. There hasn't been a
- 8 particular form. Each agency has done it
- 9 differently over the years.
- 10 Q. So you didn't have a manner in
- 11 which -- or a particular form that most
- 12 agencies used?
- 13 A. Most agencies use our investigation
- 14 request form because it's a standard form
- 15 they are used to. So typically that's what
- 16 we see.
- 17 (Exhibit 5 was marked.)
- 18 Q. Ms. Cox, I have handed you what's
- 19 been marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 5.
- 20 Is this the technical investigation request
- 21 you just referenced?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And I think you told me that
- 24 this is what most agencies use when

- 1 requesting a hold?
- 2 A. Hold, investigation, internal
- 3 investigation, FOIA requests, yeah.
- Q. Anything that says don't delete the
- 5 email account?
- 6 A. Yeah.
- 7 Q. And this -- it's a multiple-page
- 8 document. I have got a revised date of
- 9 April -- well, an issue date of
- 10 February 26th, 2008, with a revision date of
- 11 April 25, 2022. It's a seven-page document.
- 12 And there is an appendix, Appendix A. Is
- 13 this the actual form that the agency would
- 14 submit to your agency?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. And what would you expect to see on
- 17 this form as far as any type of a hold goes?
- 18 If they are requesting that you hold certain
- 19 email accounts, what would you see on here?
- 20 A. Typically, the agency puts it in
- 21 Section 3, purpose of whatever they are
- 22 needing.
- Q. And then Section 2 would be a list
- 24 of the individuals --

Page 53 1 Α. Yes. 2 -- with their email accounts? Q. 3 And their User ID's. Α. So I am giving you -- if I am the 4 5 agency, I am giving you the User ID, the email accounts saying don't delete these 7 emails? Α. Yes. 9 Who in your office would receive Appendix A to Deposition Exhibit Number 5? 10 11 The CSO box, which is a group A. 12 mailbox. It's a what mailbox? 13 Q. 14 A. It's a group mailbox. Group. And you said CSO? 15 Q. 16 A. Yes. What is that? 17 Q. Cyber security office. 18 A. 19 All right. Which one does that fall under? 20 21 Α. Me. So that's under your office? 22 Q. Okay. 23 A. Yeah. 24 Q. And so it goes into a mailbox. Who

- 1 has access to that mailbox? Everybody in
- 2 your office?
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 Q. And how is this processed? And I
- 5 am referring again to Appendix A of Depo 5.
- 6 A. Primary investigator grabs it, sees
- 7 what information is available, sees if it
- 8 makes sense, and reaches out to the agency
- 9 if it doesn't. If it does, we just do it.
- 10 And it gets assigned out to whichever
- 11 analyst is available. And depending on what
- 12 is needed, it gets done.
- 13 Q. And I understand Appendix A can
- 14 cover a lot more than just an email hold.
- 15 A. Yeah. And they are not required to
- 16 use that, but -- most default, I guess.
- 17 Q. Right. And so if you have got
- 18 Appendix A received in your CSO box, you
- 19 said the primary investigator pulls it?
- 20 A. Uh-huh.
- 21 O. Yes?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. We were talking so much before we
- 24 started the depo, I completely forgot.

- 1 A. I know. I have a bad habit about
- 2 that. I know better.
- Q. Well, it is not just that. It is
- 4 all of the rules -- which you have been
- 5 doing fine, which is why I haven't even
- 6 thought about it. And you will continue to
- 7 do fine. But yeah, try to use yes and no.
- 8 No shoulder shrugs. Make sure you wait
- 9 until I finish my question. And I don't
- 10 expect this to be long. But if you need a
- 11 break, by all means, let us know.
- 12 With regard to Appendix A, if the
- 13 -- oh, when the primary investigator
- 14 received it, you said they assigned it to
- 15 somebody?
- 16 A. It gets assigned. So it might be
- 17 the primary investigator. Depending on what
- information is actually needed, it might go
- 19 out to different teams or tasks to be tasked
- 20 out. But we have -- the primary
- 21 investigator typically coordinates it.
- Q. Okay. Who is the primary -- when
- 23 you say primary investigator, is that an
- 24 individual or a title of multiple

Page 56 1 individuals? So you have one, or is there 2 multiple primary investigators? Typically, we have one at any given 3 A. time. 5 Who is that currently? Q. 6 Currently -- currently that 7 position needs filled. 0. Who was in that? 9 Before that, it was Jim Kirk. Jim Kirk? 10 Q. Before that, it was Avis. 11 Α. And then 12 Leroy, the manager, steps in and out as 13 needed. 14 Q. Okay. And Avis, is that Chris 15 Avis? 16 Α. Yes. 17 And how long was Chris Avis the primary investigator? From when to when? 18 19 Probably for 15 years. Α. 20 When did he leave the agency? 21 2020. Α. 22 And then is that when Mr. Jim Kirk Q. 23 took over? 24 A. Yes.

Elite Court Reporting, LLC DANIELLE COX, 12/08/2023

Page 57 1 And is Mr. Kirk no longer with the 0. 2 agency, or is he no longer the lead investigator? 3 He's not a full-time employee. We 4 5 have him on a temp contract. 6 So when Chris Avis left the agency, Jim Kirk took over as lead investigator --7 lead investigator? 8 9 A. Lead analyst. 10 You told me that it goes in a COS box, a particular person pulled it -- I've 11 12 already lost their title. 13 A. The lead analyst, lead 14 investigator, whatever you want. 15 Q. Lead analyst? Yeah. We just refer to them as 16 17 leads. 18 Q. Okay. 19 A. They're leads. 20 0. And that's what I want. I want 21 your-all's terminology, not mine. 22 Yeah. Director, manager, lead. A. 23 How long was Mr. Kirk the lead? Q. 24 He was fully employed for A.

- 1 two years. And then he went to full --
- 2 contractor status.
- 3 Q. So from 2022 to sometime in 20 --
- 4 I'm sorry -- 2020?
- 5 A. Yeah. The end of 2020 is when
- 6 Chris left. And then Kirk took over.
- 7 Q. He was there until when in 2022?
- 8 A. He is still here.
- 9 Q. Is he still the lead?
- 10 A. He is still the lead, yeah.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. But I have different -- I mean, I
- 13 have more analysts right now.
- 14 Q. Got you.
- 15 So when Appendix A would come in or
- 16 a similar form, and if it was a request just
- 17 to hold email, an email account, would
- 18 Mr. Avis or Mr. Kirk actually do it, or
- 19 would they assign it to an analyst to do?
- 20 A. It gets tasked out in Ivanti to
- 21 accounts management.
- Q. And so we are clear, the Appendix A
- 23 could be used for an email hold, but it also
- 24 could be used to say search for this

Page 59 1 information or --2 Yeah. 3 Q. -- do -- find some data or things 4 along that line, correct? A. Yes. Login/logout, times of 5 6 employees, all sorts of stuff. 7 Used a lot for determining time 8 clock fraud or --9 A. No comment. 10 Q. -- things along that line? 11 (Nods head.) Α. When your agency -- whether it be 12 13 the CSO or the analyst or whoever, when they 14 receive this request to hold an email account, if it's just a request to hold, 15 16 don't delete, is there any reason for them 17 to go into the account? Do they look at it? 18 Do they do anything with it? 19 Α. No. 20 What exactly do they do? How do they hold it? 21 22 So in Google -- we use Google 23 Vault. And there is a retention section in 24 there. We go and literally move the user

- 1 and say, Okay, this person's email calendar,
- 2 whatever applications they have with Google
- 3 are now retained.
- 4 O. And then that email account is
- 5 retained until when?
- A. Until they take off the hold.
- 7 Q. The hold. So what's that --
- 8 A. And if something is in there that
- 9 can't be deleted, the scripts prevent it
- 10 because those scripts check it.
- 11 Q. Thank you. That's what I was
- 12 after. So once that hold gets instigated
- 13 and initiated, it can't be deleted no matter
- 14 what else happens until somebody goes in and
- 15 reviews that hold?
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 (Exhibit 6 was marked.)
- 18 Q. Ms. Cox, I just handed you what's
- 19 been marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 6.
- 20 It's a document titled Litigation Hold,
- 21 three-page document.
- 22 First question, are you familiar
- 23 with this particular document?
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 61 1 0. And when is the first time you saw 2 this document? 3 Α. Back in 2019. 4 And how is it that you saw it in 5 2019? How was it that it came across your 6 desk? 7 We do -- on our team, we do like a 8 weekly review of open investigations, what 9 my guys are doing. So they should have --10 this information goes up to the manager, and 11 the manager shares it to me. 12 Q. I'm sorry. One more. I missed 13 that. 14 The manager, he shared --A. Yeah. 15 this one specifically went directly to Chris 16 Avis. Chris shared it with his manager so 17 we would all be in the loop. 18 Who was Mr. Avis's manager at the Q. 19 time? 20 Α. Amos -- Leroy Amos. 21 And how did Mr. Avis receive this? Q. It was in an email attachment. 22 Α. 23 Q. And what did the email say? Who was the email from? 24

Page 62 1 Probably Jacqueline. I don't know. A. 2 Do you recall the email? Q. 3 A. No. It was in the documents we 4 provided. I didn't see it in there. 5 0. That's 6 why I am asking. Do you think you provided 7 it and I missed it, or do you think that you still have it? 8 9 I am pretty sure we provided it. 10 Q. Okay. We will double-check. 11 And it was an email specifically to Mr. Avis, or is it to all individuals in the 12 To section? 13 All of the individuals. 14 A. So Mr. Avis received this via 15 Q. 16 email, and you said from -- you thought from Jacqueline? 17 She was their admin staff that sent 18 A. 19 stuff. What's her full name? 20 Q. 21 Α. (No response.) 22 Q. That's okay. 23 Jacqueline. Α. 24 Q. Mrs.?

Page 63 She is nice. 1 A. 2 MR. ROSS: This (indicating)? 3 MR. WALTERS: Oh, right. Yeah, I know you gave us this. I was talking 4 5 about the email, the actual email. Q. Because it's my understanding that 6 the litigation hold letter, Deposition 7 Exhibit Number 6, came to Mr. Avis through 8 an actual email, and this was -- the 9 litigation hold was an attachment to that 10 email? 11 12 Α. Yes. 13 And that email is what I am asking 0. about. Do you think you --14 15 We have it. Α. 16 Q. Okay. That's why I was asking. 17 know you guys gave us a copy of the 18 litigation hold letter. I don't think there was much on the 19 A. actual email. 20 21 That's what I was asking about. 22 don't know because I don't think I have seen 23 that. 24 Yeah. I mean, I can -- I can --Α.

Page 64 1 0. Okay. We will cover that. That's 2 all I needed to know about that. So when Mr. Avis received this 3 email litigation hold, at some point after 4 5 that he brought it to your attention? 6 Yeah. A. And what did you do or what did 7 Q. your office do when you received this 8 9 litigation hold? When we received it, we didn't do 10 technically anything for it. We didn't 11 12 realize that we had actions that needed 13 taken. 14 Is there anything in this 0. 15 particular document that tells you -- tells the Office of Technology it didn't do 16 17 anything? There is nothing that we can do 18 19 from a technical perspective. And explain that to me. What do 20 21 you mean there is nothing you can do from a 22 technical standpoint? 23 We manage 20,000 emails. A. 24 Right. Q.

- 1 A. Right. I don't know what is in
- 2 those emails. You talked about do we look
- 3 into an account, do we check an account --
- 4 no. When it is something like this and it
- 5 tells us they are getting sued about foster
- 6 care, that doesn't mean anything to us. I
- 7 mean, we are Google for the state. So we
- 8 don't know what our people are doing.
- 9 Q. Right.
- 10 A. We also get a lot of these types of
- 11 documents that are FYI's that work is going
- 12 to come. Because we did do a lot of work
- 13 for this -- hundreds of hours we billed
- 14 DHHR.
- 15 Q. So let me make sure I understand
- 16 this. When you all received the litigation
- 17 hold that is Deposition Exhibit Number 6,
- 18 you treated that more like an FYI, there is
- 19 going to be a lot of work coming down the
- 20 pike because we've got massive litigation
- 21 regarding the foster care system?
- 22 A. Yeah. And when Avis did work --
- 23 because, you know, we had open cases with
- 24 MIS for other issues, it immediately went

- 1 into document production. So our
- 2 investigators thought we were completing
- 3 whatever our agency needed us to do for this
- 4 document.
- 5 Q. Because this particular document
- 6 doesn't request that the Office of
- 7 Technology preserve or hold any email
- 8 accounts, correct?
- 9 A. Well, I mean, it says stuff, yes.
- 10 Q. But when you received this --
- 11 A. From like a technical perspective,
- 12 I couldn't act on it, no.
- 13 Q. Right.
- 14 A. I don't know like which emails.
- 15 Q. Right. There's nothing in this
- 16 letter that tells you what email addresses
- 17 need to be preserved?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. And when you received this, was
- 20 there any discussions with Shaun Charles at
- 21 MIS to say, listen, do we need to do
- 22 anything at this point in time?
- 23 A. We don't have any call logs that go
- 24 back that far. And the emails were pretty

- 1 light. I know they had a fairly regular
- 2 sync up on talks. But like I said, it
- 3 pretty much went into immediate --
- 4 Q. Document production?
- 5 A. -- document production. And from
- 6 where -- from a technical standpoint --
- 7 usually when we hit document production,
- 8 that's what we are doing. We are not
- 9 holding specific emails at that point.
- 10 Q. And if DHHR wanted the Office of
- 11 Technology to hold a certain email account,
- 12 would you expect them to send you a specific
- 13 request telling you that?
- 14 A. They would have to tell me the
- 15 names, yeah.
- 16 Q. Right. And the passwords and the
- 17 email accounts?
- 18 A. No. They don't have to tell me
- 19 passwords.
- Q. Because you know them?
- 21 A. No. I don't know them.
- Q. You don't know the passwords of the
- 23 accounts?
- 24 A. No. I don't want to. That's a

- 1 security risk.
- Q. But you would have to know at least
- 3 the names of the individuals of which
- 4 accounts they want you to hold in order to
- 5 do it?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Have you received requests in the
- 8 past from DHHR to hold specific email
- 9 accounts?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And how did you receive those, do
- 12 you recall?
- 13 A. I'm pretty sure it was the same
- 14 form.
- 15 Q. So you've received similar letters
- 16 like Deposition Exhibit Number 6 from DHHR
- 17 telling you to hold specific email accounts?
- 18 A. Yeah. They have had specific like
- 19 people.
- Q. So in 2019, when you received this
- 21 particular letter, had you already received
- 22 -- not necessarily in this case, but you had
- 23 previously received documentation from DHHR
- 24 saying we need you to preserve these

Page 69 1 particular email accounts? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. So they knew how to request you to hold an account? 4 5 Yeah. I do believe it was a 6 different attorney though. 7 If you look at page 3 of Deposition Exhibit Number 6, there is an 8 9 acknowledgement form on there. Is that 10 something that your office would typically return? 11 12 No. A. 13 Q. Why not? 14 If we didn't act -- take any Α. 15 action, we don't sign anything. 16 Q. So there is no point in acknowledging if you don't have to do 17 18 anything? 19 Α. Correct. 20 Anybody from DHHR ever contact you to say how come you didn't return the form? 21 22 I have no idea. Α. 23 Q. Anybody ever contact you? 24 A. No.

Page 70 1 MR. WALTERS: We actually have 2 been going about an hour. Let's take a 3 short five-minute break. (Break in proceedings.) 5 BY MR. WALTERS: 6 Q. As we were talking about off the record, we did locate the email that was 7 attached -- or that the litigation hold was 8 9 attached to. It was actually sent from a 10 Janet Huffman. Do you know Janet? 11 Α. No. 12 I believe she was or is a paralegal 0. in Ms. Robertson's office? 13 14 I had the J right. Α. 15 So who was Jacqueline? Ο. 16 The other one. Probably the new A. 17 paralegal from that one. 18 All right. You had mentioned that 0. 19 soon after you received the litigation hold 20 that was Deposition Exhibit Number 6, that 21 your office was engaged in document retention with MIS; is that fair? 22 23 A. Yes. 24 Q. And some pretty extensive document

retention? Page 71

2 A. Very extensive.

1

- Q. Okay. And to your knowledge, at
- 4 any time during that entire process, was
- 5 there ever a request to preserve -- and when
- 6 I say was there ever, I mean from the time
- 7 of the litigation hold on December 4th of
- 8 2019 until August of this year -- did your
- 9 office receive a request separately or
- 10 through that interaction with MIS to
- 11 preserve any email accounts?
- 12 A. The specific email account
- 13 preservations didn't come until this year.
- 14 Q. Until --
- 15 A. Yeah.
- 16 Q. -- August -- there is --
- 17 A. Some of them had been put into
- 18 place for other issues during -- yeah.
- 19 Q. Yeah. And I wanted to get to that
- 20 too. Because it's my understanding that
- 21 there were -- there was at least one
- 22 individual who had separated employment with
- 23 the state whose email was preserved. And I
- 24 guess that was my question, is why was one

Page 72

- 1 but nobody else? And I think that might be
- 2 the answer. But it was -- I believe it was
- 3 Jeremiah Samples?
- A. Yeah. He was preserved.
- 5 Q. And he was preserved for some
- 6 reason other than this litigation?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. So the reason that your
- 9 office was able to produce his emails was
- 10 not because of any litigation hold or
- 11 request to preserve it through DHHR in this
- 12 matter, but from somebody in a different
- 13 matter?
- 14 A. Correct. And that's why some of
- 15 them were preserved, is because they have
- 16 multiple holds. And they don't have to
- 17 request for a litigation hold. When we say
- 18 a litigation -- it doesn't have to be a
- 19 litigation hold. If a cabinet secretary
- 20 says they want us to hold an email, we are
- 21 going to hold an email.
- Q. Right. Specifically with regard to
- 23 Mr. Samples, did you receive a written
- 24 request from DHHR to hold that email

Page 73 1 account? 2 A. No. 3 How was that communicated to your 0. office? 4 5 A. It was called in to my CIO at the time. 6 7 And who called that in? Crouch called. 8 Α. 9 Q. So Bill Crouch called and said I 10 want you to put a hold on Mr. Samples' email 11 account? 12 Yes. One might have came in later from April's office. But I don't have that 13 14 one off -- it might. Because there was 15 four. I think she sent four at some point. 16 And it might be in there. I don't know. 17 There's a lot. 18 Q. When you say four, do you mean four 19 separate requests or four email accounts? 20 Four email accounts and a request 21 -- and a singular request not related to 22 this case. 23 Q. Right. And when was that received? 24 A. Probably last year.

Page 74 1 It was a request from Ms. Robertson 2 saying hold these four email accounts, or something to that effect? A. Yes. Did she by chance use the PR-1001? 5 Or am I the only one that refers to it as 6 7 that? 8 You're the only one -- it's the A. investigation form. 9 10 Yes. 0. 11 No. She didn't use that form. I think it was just an email. 12 13 Okay. Sounds so much better than 14 PR-1001 form. 15 We have a lot of PR's, yeah. 16 0. I know. 17 You only saw a fraction of them. I like documentation. 18 19 Q. Has DHHR ever used the Appendix A 20 to the PR-1001? 21 Α. Yes. Has DHHR ever used Appendix A for 22 23 purposes of preserving email accounts? 24 A. I don't know. We don't always have

Page 75

- 1 the reason we are performing the requests.
- 2 I don't know what their reason is for the
- 3 request.
- 4 Q. Right. I don't mean a reason. But
- 5 have they ever used that form to request the
- 6 hold on an email account?
- 7 A. I don't know. I would have to go
- 8 back through all of them.
- 9 Q. When you get a -- Deposition
- 10 Exhibit Number 6 has an acknowledgement
- 11 form. When have you ever received -- has
- 12 your office to your knowledge ever received
- 13 an email request or a request to preserve
- 14 email accounts with an acknowledgement form?
- 15 A. From DHHR?
- 16 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And in those situations, would you
- 19 or somebody in your office fill out the
- 20 acknowledgement form and send it back?
- 21 A. If we had an actionable item --
- 22 like it listed an account?
- 23 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 76 Okay. So if they actually sent you 1 Q. 2 an email similar to Deposition 6 and said 3 preserve these ten emails and here is the acknowledgement --5 Yes. A. 6 0. -- then you would actually sign 7 that acknowledgement and send it back? 8 Α. Yes. 9 So then I guess it stems from that, 10 that the DHHR has received acknowledgement 11 forms from WVOT in the past? 12 Yes. From Avis. I know he signed a few of them that we have done. 13 14 Q. Avis did? 15 Uh-huh. Α. 16 Q. This might have been a conversation 17 I had in my head. I don't know if I asked you this or not. We talked about how when 18 19 -- after you received -- after WVOT received 20 the litigation hold, which is Deposition 21 Exhibit Number 6, you began engaging in pretty extensive mining or document 22 retrieval, correct? 23 24 Α. Yes.

Page 77 1 Through that document retrieval, Q. 2 would that trigger any action on WVOT's part 3 to preserve an email account if they are not specifically asked to? No. We don't make assumptions --5 6 we try not to. 7 And your analysts aren't lawyers, 8 they are not going to interpret this stuff 9 and figure out what needs to be held and not held? 10 11 No. We are full nerds. Α. 12 Nothing wrong with that. Q. 13 What type of training does your 14 office provide with regard to 15 deprovisioning, account security, things 16 along that line? 17 That's a broad question. A. 18 Q. Well, let me make it a little bit 19 easier for you. Does your office provide 20 training? 21 Α. Yes. 22 I have read your forms. Q. 23 A. I mean, it is nice that somebody 24 has read them. Policy writing is

Page 78 1 underappreciated. 2 (Exhibit 7 was marked.) 3 Ms. Cox, I am going to hand you ο. 4 what's been marked as Deposition Exhibit 5 Number 7. 6 A. Yes. I'd ask you to identify what this 7 8 document is. 9 This is an internal procedure for our technicians. 10 11 So this is a -- when you say 12 internal procedure for, you are talking 13 specifically for the West Virginia Office of 14 Technology? 15 Yeah. It is what our people do. Oh, wait, I lied. 16 17 Here, this might be part of your Q. 18 confusion. Let me give you something else. 19 (Exhibit 8 was marked.) 20 I've handed you what's been marked 21 as Deposition Exhibit Number 7 and Number 8. 22 Number 7 is a document received from your 23 office dated -- not dated -- but Bates 24 numbers 26 through 33. Deposition Exhibit

Page 79 1 Number 8 is what I printed off through your 2 website. 3 Α. Yes. So this is the -- eight is the overall policy -- overarching policy. 4 5 And seven is the step by step, how do you fill out the form -- a deprovision form and 6 7 all of those options that we have. Okay. Give me a little bit more 8 9 than that. What I am looking at here is two 10 documents, both titled Account Management, both issued by CTO, both titled -- now, they 11 12 are different PR -- I mean, one is a PR and 13 one is a PO. 14 So it's policy -- policies, 15 procedure, process is how --16 So Deposition 8 is the overall 17 policy? 18 It's the policy. It's the 19 structure. Deposition 7 is the actual 20 21 procedure for implementing --22 Α. Yes. 23 -- Deposition 8? Q. 24 Correct. Α.

Page 80 1 Q. Perfect. 2 And if you look at Deposition 3 Exhibit 7, 3.13, all designated agency 4 contacts will receive training from the WVOT regarding this procedure. It's on page 1, 5 right under 3.0 --6 7 Α. Yes. 8 Q. -- do you see it there? 9 Okay. A couple of questions there. What is a designated agency contact? 10 11 Α. That's the DAA. 12 Okay. That's the DAA we talked Q. 13 about? 14 A. Yeah. 15 Q. So for purposes of the 16 deprovisionings that we saw earlier, it 17 would have been Beth Jarrett? 18 A. Yes. So based upon this policy, somebody 19 20 at WVOT would have trained Ms. Jarrett on how to complete that particular form? 21 22 Yes. Α. 23 As well as everything else Q. 24 contained in this particular policy?

Page 81 1 Α. Yes. 2 Now, if you look at Deposition 3 Exhibit Number 8 - okay - top of page 2, 4 3.6, that's in essence the same thing, just 5 worded differently, correct? 6 Α. Yes. So the designated approval 7 authority - DAA - in this case is Beth 8 9 Jarrett? Yes. One of them. They have a 10 Α. list. 11 12 How does that work? I understand you can't have just one for all of DHHR. 13 But who was Ms. Jarrett the DAA for? 14 15 I would have to go check. But Α. 16 given this, the cabinet secretary's office. 17 And I guess that kind of answers my 18 question then. So you have a list of DAA's 19 that tells you which agencies or which 20 departments they are authorized for? 21 Yes. Α. 22 Okay. Q. It is a rather long list for DHHR. 23 A. 24 I would imagine. Q.

Page 82 Is anybody else designated as a DAA 1 for the cabinet secretary's office besides 2 Ms. Jarrett? 3 I do not know. A. 5 You would have to look at the list? 6 Yeah. 7 Is anyone in the general counsel's Q. office a DAA? 8 9 I don't know without looking at the list. It's a big list. 10 I appreciate that. 11 Q. 12 (Exhibit 9 was marked.) 13 Ms. Cox, I've handed you what's 14 been marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 9. If you could, explain to me what this 15 16 document is. This is the policy on how we create 17 18 policies and procedures. Because -- yeah. 19 Q. Did you draft this policy? 20 Α. I did. I drafted all of the OT policies. 21 22 Drafted or revised? 0. They didn't exist before I came to 23 work for the state. 24

Page 83 Q. What year did you start? 1 2 These -- these specific ones --A. 3 Q. The reason why I am asking -- so a lot of these have issue dates of like 2003, 4 2008. 5 They were a lot lighter. 6 A. 7 Understood. Q. Yeah. Let's just say they didn't 8 A. 9 meet my standards. 10 All right. If you look at the 11 first page of Depo Number 9 -- I think you told me this was basically a policy of how 12 to create policies? 13 14 A. Yes. And consistent with that 15 representation, 3.3 talks about individual 16 17 agencies creating policies? Yes. 18 Α. And if they create their own IT 19 Q. 20 policies, and they are required to submit 21 them to you for review, correct? 22 A. Correct. 23 Q. Does DHHR have their own IT 24 policies?

Page 84 1 A. Some of them, yes. 2 Q. And do you know who does? 3 Who writes them? Α. No. Who has them in DHHR, which 4 5 departments have their own IT policies? 6 They would be -- the ones that we 7 have seen that we know of have been issued 8 by MIS. 9 Q. Okay. So MIS --MIS is IT for --10 A. 11 0. DHHR? 12 Yeah. All of them. We don't have any like individual IT groups out in the 13 14 field. 15 Q. Thank you. 16 So nobody other than -- under DHHR, 17 nobody but MIS would be creating internal 18 policies on IT? 19 A. On IT stuff, yeah. 20 Q. So MIS has created its own IT policies for --21 22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. -- DHHR? 24 Α. Yes.

Elite Court Reporting, LLC DANIELLE COX, 12/08/2023

Page 85 1 If you look at the bottom of that Q. 2 page on 3.3.4, Each agency will designate an 3 individual who will be responsible for reviewing all policies and procedures if 4 5 applicable with all newly transferred and 6 hired employees. 7 Do you know who that individual is 8 for DHHR? 9 A. No. Do you know who it is for MIS? 10 Q. 11 A. No. 12 0. Shaun Charles, chief information 13 officer for MIS -- to your knowledge, is he aware of how the deprovisioning works? 14 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. Is he aware of the 30-day 17 destruction policy? 18 I mean, he is now I guess. Yeah, I 19 don't know -- I have no idea. 20 Well, I mean, the 30-day policy has 21 been in place for at least 20 years based 22 upon the documentation. It wasn't a secret, 23 correct? 24 No. A.

Page 86 1 And everybody in IT knew it, right? Q. 2 A. Right. He has not been here that 3 long. Q. How long has he been here, do you 5 know? I think he has been here less than 7 four years. He came like right during COVID 8 -- I think right before this case actually. 9 The training provided by WVOT, 10 would that include the 30-day destruction 11 policy? 12 A. Yes. He did Google training for everybody in the Enterprise when we migrated 13 in 2022. 14 15 Q. We have talked about Deposition 16 Exhibit Number 6, the litigation hold in 17 2019. Do you recall in 2022 -- late '22, 18 early this year, receiving a request to 19 preserve Bill Crouch's email address from 20 DHHR? 21 We had one in October. You don't recall anything prior to 22 Q. 23 October? 24 Α. No.

Page 87 1 Do you recall receiving a Q. 2 litigation hold letter from DHHR in late '22 or early 2023? And when I say a litigation 3 4 hold, I am referring to something similar to 5 Deposition Exhibit Number 6. 6 You mean for this specific --7 Not for this -- not necessarily for 8 this case, just in general, but dealing with 9 Mr. Crouch? I do not -- I don't recall. 10 (Exhibit 10 was marked.) 11 12 (A discussion was held off the 13 record.) 14 BY MR. WALTERS: Ms. Cox, I have handed you what's 15 16 been marked as Deposition Exhibit Number 10. Yes. 17 Α. It is a letter dated December 20, 18 0. 19 2022, from Disciplinary Rights West Virginia 20 to Jeffrey Coben. Have you seen this document before? 21 22 No. Α. 23 Q. No? 24 Α. No.

Page 88

1 Q. If you would, turn to the --

- 2 there's more on this than there should be.
- 3 Turn to page 8, the signature line at the
- 4 very end -- almost the very end. There is
- 5 an attachment on this thing. Probably
- 6 shouldn't be there.
- 7 A. Am I dumb? Oh, no. It's the one
- 8 that is already signed -- okay.
- 9 Q. Yes. Signature line.
- 10 A. Sorry.
- 11 Q. There you go. That's okay.
- 12 Below that signature there, there
- is a handful of people that are cc'd on
- 14 this. And if you flip to the next page,
- 15 that list continues. So I wouldn't be
- 16 shocked if it wasn't there. I did my own
- 17 copying.
- 18 Nobody on those cc's -- well, is
- 19 anybody on those cc's in your office?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. Do you recall whether or not in
- 22 December of 2022 anybody in your office
- 23 received this letter?
- 24 A. I don't recall, no.

Page 89 Do you know whether or not you 1 2 received a litigation hold request as a result of this letter? 3 A. I don't recall. It's fair to say you did not 5 6 receive a request to preserve Bill Crouch's 7 email account prior to October of this year, 8 correct? 9 By technical standards, no. 10 Q. How many -- throughout the course 11 of the year, do you have a feel for how many requests that you receive to preserve email 12 13 accounts? 14 For just email, before this year? A. 15 Before this year. 0. 16 Α. About 30. 17 Q. About 30 a year? 18 Rotating. Maintaining 30. A. Yeah. 19 Some go in, some come out. 20 So at any given time, you are maintaining 30 email accounts? 21 22 Α. Yeah. 23 Q. And I know when we looked at 24 Deposition Exhibit 1 and 2, the

Page 90 1 deprovisioning documents, it didn't include 2 -- there's nothing on there that says, you 3 know, hold this account or anything along that line? 5 A. Correct. 6 But if the individual submitting 7 that email to your office wants you to hold the account, it would be as simple as doing 8 9 a follow-up email to that saying hold the 10 account that we just deprovisioned? 11 They could do that, yeah. A. 12 Picking up the phone and calling Q. 13 you and asking you to? 14 If they wanted to, yes. A. 15 MR. WALTERS: Ms. Cox, let's take a short break. I think I am about 16 17 done. 18 (Break in proceedings.) 19 MR. WALTERS: We have nothing 20 Thank you very much. further. 21 **EXAMINATION** BY MS. BROWN: 22 23 I have just a few guick follow-up

24

questions.

Page 91 1 For the training of individuals at 2 the agency who have designated approval authority that WVOT gives the training, are 3 there any written training materials? They typically go through like 5 No. one-on-one with them in how to do the forms 6 7 and stuff. 8 I just wanted to make sure. there any sort of training checklists, I 9 10 covered these topics with the person being 11 trained? 12 Α. No. 13 Q. Okay. Do you know whether the 14 30-day deletion of email accounts is part of 15 the training? 16 For the DAA? 17 Q. Yes. I have no idea. 18 Α. No. 19 Q. And then just a few quick questions 20 about the document that the 12 -- the 21 December 2019 litigation hold document. 22 MR. WALTERS: Depo Number 6. 23 Number 6, yes. MS. BROWN: 24 Sorry.

Page 92

- 1 Q. I think you testified that nothing
- 2 could be done based on this document from a
- 3 technical perspective; is that right?
- 4 A. Right.
- 5 Q. And there was a team meeting of
- 6 some sort at which this document was
- 7 reviewed and discussed; is that right?
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 Q. And to your knowledge, was there
- 10 any follow-up with Ms. Robertson or anyone
- 11 else at DHHR that the document was not
- 12 technically operation -- that there wasn't
- 13 anything that could be done from a technical
- 14 perspective based on this -- based on how it
- 15 was --
- 16 A. It was followed up with Charles --
- 17 Shaun Charles and -- did production. We
- 18 didn't -- the document didn't come back up
- 19 in those discussions, no.
- Q. Okay. But I just -- as far as you
- 21 know, Chris Avis didn't say to Shaun Charles
- 22 or anyone else, I am not sure what you want
- 23 me to do with this document?
- A. No. I don't have records of that.

Page 93 1 MS. BROWN: Okay. That's it for 2 me. 3 **RE-EXAMINATION** BY MR. WALTERS: 4 5 The follow-up that you were just Q. 6 referring to with Shaun Charles, was that a 7 follow-up to the hold -- I'm sorry --8 follow-up to Deposition Number 6? Or was 9 that just the subsequent here are the 10 documents we need you to pull? 11 Say again. Α. 12 Q. Sure. 13 The follow-up you were just 14 discussing with Shaun Charles --15 Yeah. A. 16 -- was that follow-up specifically Q. to the litigation hold letter of December 4, 17 2019? In other words, when you received 18 19 this, was there a conversation with Shaun 20 Charles, or was it -- well, let me stop there. Was there a conversation as a result 21 22 of receiving this letter? 23 By itself, no. I don't believe so. 24 I think it was just a collection. Because

Page 94 1 there was so many open investigations and 2 stuff, they sync on a regular basis. 3 is like, what are we doing, what do you need us to do at this point. They have regular 5 calls like that. 6 Q. And then at some point after that, 7 you started getting the search terms and 8 pulling documents? 9 A. Yes. 10 MR. WALTERS: You are done. 11 Read? 12 MR. ROSS: Yes. 13 (Deposition concluded at 10:48 a.m.) 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24

1	CERTIFICATE	Page	95
2			
3	I, Tara Arthur, Certified Stenotype		
4	Reporter and Notary Public, do hereby		
5	certify that the foregoing deposition of the		
6	above-named witness, was duly taken by me in		
7	machine shorthand, and that the same were		
8	accurately written out in full and reduced		
9	to computer transcription.		
10	I further certify that I am neither		
11	attorney or counsel for, nor related to or		
12	employed by any of the parties to the action		
13	in which this deposition is taken; and		
14	furthermore, that I am not a relative or		
15	employee of any attorney or counsel employed		
16	by the parties hereto or financially		
17	interested in the action.		
18	My commission expires April 16, 2027.		
19	ara arthur		
20	Tara Arthur		
21	Certified Court Reporter/Notary Public		
22			
23			
24			

Exhibits Cox 120823 E x 1 4:8 22:6,9 36:17 43:12 89:24	83:11 Cox 120823 E x 10 4:12 87:11,16	20 27:6 41:7 58:3 85:21 87:18 20,000 21:23 64:23 20-foot 35:15	3 39:13,16 52:21 69:7	5 5 5 5 5 5 17:17 53:10 53:17:17
Cox 120823 E x 2 4:8 36:6,7, 9,10,17 37:7 Cox 120823 E x 3 4:9 39:13, 15,16 Cox 120823 E x 4 4:9 41:19, 21 Cox 120823 E x 5 4:10 51:17,19 53:10 Cox 120823 E x 6 4:10 60:17,19 63:8 65:17 68:16 69:8 70:20 75:10 76:21 86:16 87:5 91:22,23 93:8 Cox 120823 E x 7 4:11 78:2, 4,5,21,22 80:3 Cox 120823 E x 8 4:11 78:19,21,24 79:1 81:3 Cox 120823 E x 9 4:12 82:12,14	0014 23:8 0015 23:8 0034 39:16 1 1 22:6,9 36:17 43:12 44:5 80:5 89:24 10 87:11,16 10:48 94:13 116,000 23:13,18 116774 23:11 12 6:10 91:20 15 14:8 56:19 152 17:17 16 36:10 17 36:10 18 41:23 1:16:29 26:4 2 2 36:6,7,10,17 37:7 43:5,13 44:5 52:23 81:3 89:24	2003 40:17 83:4 2004 10:24 2005 10:24 2008 52:10 83:5 2012 11:1 2019 6:2,4 61:3,5 68:20 71:8 86:17 91:21 93:18 2020 56:21 58:4,5 2022 26:4 30:1 42:24 52:11 58:3,7 86:14,17 87:19 88:22 2023 27:6 30:2 87:3 20th 27:6 21 44:12 22 47:14 86:17 87:2 24 39:23,24 25 41:23 45:14 46:17 47:2,5 52:11 26 78:24	3.0 80:6 3.13 80:3 3.3 83:16 3.3.4 85:2 3.6 81:4 30 14:11 17:8, 10 26:4 29:16,21 30:1,2 31:3 37:18 38:23 39:6,9 40:24 41:4 44:4 45:22,24 46:1,17 47:5, 20,21 48:6 49:19,21 89:16,17,18, 21 30-day 37:24 41:9 46:14 47:3 85:16,20 86:10 91:14 33 78:24 4 41:19,21 93:17 400 23:24 4th 71:7	6 6 60:17,19 63:8 65:17 68:16 69:8 70:20 75:10 76:2,21 86:16 87:5 91:22,23 93:8 60 17:21 7 7 78:2,5,21,22 79:20 80:3 8 8 78:19,21 79:1,16,23 81:3 88:3 9 9 82:12,14 83:11 A a.m. 94:13 Abbott 18:7, 8,12

12 12:9 13:2,9 29:19,24 39:11 86:19 44:20 April 52:9,11 29:2 33:13 40:20, 23 41:3,5 addresses 66:16 allowed 21:14 April's 73:13 accepted 41:4 50:15,16,24 50:15,16,24 52:19 53:2,6 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 7:18 25:4,5 28:19,22 29:10,15,20, 24 31:9,22 73:19,20 74:2,23 75:14 89:13.21 29:19,24 31:9,24 39:11 86:19 Addresses 66:16 21:14 April 52:9,11 44:20 April's 73:13 architecture 9:14 20:15,20,23, 24 61:20 Archive 34:2 areas 7:17 arises 16:10 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 7:11 7:11 7:11 7:11 7:11 7:11					2
29:2 17:15 21:19 accepted 33:13 40:20, 41:4 23 41:3,5 50:15,16,24 admin 5:17 50:15,16,24 p:10 15:13,17 52:19 53:2,6 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 28:19,22 73:19,20 24 31:9,22 74:2,23 75:14 32:6 33:13 40:20, 33:13 40:20, 23 41:3,5 admin 5:17 9:10 15:13,17 20:15,20,23, 24 61:20 amount 37:13 amount 37:13 assign 10:2 13,20 54:11 57:9,13,15 58:19 58:19		12:9 13:2,9	29:19,24		approximatel y 30:1
33:13 40:20, 23 41:3,5 50:15,16,24 52:19 53:2,6 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 73:19,20 24 31:9,22 23:6 33:13 40:20, 23 41:3,5 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 73:19,20 74:2,23 75:14 89:13.21 33:13 40:20, 23 41:3,5 66:16 21:14 Amos 19:4,7 20:15,20,23, 24 61:20 areas 7:17 arises 16:10 assign 10:2 13:2 48:9 58:19 59:13	-	'			April 52:9,11
accepted 23 41:3,5 41:4 50:15,16,24 access 14:10, 52:19 53:2,6 58:21 66:8 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 28:19,22 73:19,20 24 31:9,22 74:2,23 75:14 32:6 33:13 15 89:13.21 23 41:3,5 50:15,16,24 admin 5:17 9:10 15:13,17 9:10 15:13,17 20:15,20,23, 24 61:20 amount 37:13 amount 37:13 amount 37:13 assign 10:2 13,20 54:11 57:9,13,15 58:19 58:19		33:13 40:20,			April's 73:13
access 14:10, 12 15:7,10, 13,18,19 16:3 17:18 25:4,5 28:19,22 29:10,15,20, 24 31:9,22 23:6 33:12 15 52:19 53:2,6 58:21 66:8 67:17,23 68:4,9,17 69:1 71:11 73:19,20 74:2,23 75:14 89:13.21 9:10 15:13,17 20:15,20,23, 24 61:20 archive 34:2 archive	•				
12 15:7,10, 58:21 66:8 24:4,5 46:16, 24 61:20 archive 34:2 13,18,19 16:3 67:17,23 48:19 49:1,2, amount 37:13 areas 7:17 28:19,22 73:19,20 3,6,10 62:18 analyst 6:5, 13,20 54:11 assign 10:2 24 31:9,22 74:2,23 75:14 n 19:24 58:19 59:13 58:19					
17:18 25:4,5 28:19,22 29:10,15,20, 24 31:9,22 32:6 33:13 15 89:13.21 48:19 49:1,2, 3,6,10 62:18 amount 37:13 analyst 6:5, 13,20 54:11 57:9,13,15 58:19 59:13 58:19 58:19	•	58:21 66:8			archive 34:2
17:18 25:4,5 28:19,22 29:10,15,20, 24 31:9,22 32:6 33:12 15 89:13.21 3,6,10 62:18 administratio n 19:24 analyst 6:5, 13,20 54:11 57:9,13,15 58:19 59:13 58:19		i i		amount 37:13	areas 7:17
29:10,15,20, 73:19,20 administratio 13,20 54:11 assign 10:2 13:2 48:9 57:9,13,15 58:19 59:13		, ,			arises 16:10
l auministrativ	29:10,15,20, 24 31:9,22 32:6 33:12,15	73:19,20 74:2,23 75:14 89:13,21		13,20 54:11 57:9,13,15	13:2 48:9 58:19
46:23 54:1 acknowledge ment 69:9 admins 16:11 analysts assigned 16:12 54:10 16:12 54:10 58:13 77:7 55:14,16	46:23 54:1	acknowledge	admins 16:11	12:21,24 13:5	16:12 54:10
22,24 14:2 75:10,14,20 49:9 answers 81:17 answers 37:3	22,24 14:2 15:5,8,17,24	76:4,7,10	49:9		
17:9,18 g 69:17 20:11 apparently 40:16 77:5	17:9,18	g 69:17	20:11		
29:21 32:22 act 66:12 32:21 appendix 70:8,9	29:21 32:22 34:3,9 36:15,		32:21		
19 37:2,3 action 69:15 7:10,22 12:22 55:12 58:15, 22 74:19,22 88:5	38:13,22	77:2	7:10,22 12:22 17:2 35:10	55:12 58:15,	61:22 63:10
43:18,19 44:17 45:14, 75:21 51:12,13,24 applicable attacks 20:3	,			applicable	
15,19,21 actions 64:12 agency 10:3 attention 44:8 64:5 47:4 22 48:4 7.0 24:8 9 26:18 9:13 33:16.18	15,19,21 46:3,7,12	activity 17:6,	14:14 17:1	applications	44:8 64:5
49:3,12,14 26:22 27:22 43:7,9 60:2	, ,	,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	60:2	attorney 69:6
58:17 59:15, 31:15 33:16 44:15 50:4, applied 6:16 12:2		31:15 33:16	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		•
17 60:4 65:3 52:13 63:5,9, 51:4,8 52:13, approval 32:20 81:7 audits 6:21					audits 6:21
71:12 73:1,11 AD 43:18 54:8 56:20 91:2 August 71:8,	71:12 73:1,11	AD 43:18	54:8 56:20	91:2	August 71:8,
75:6,22 77:3, additional 57:2,6 59:12 approve 16:3 80:3,10 38:15 authority	·		· ·		
15 79:10 89:7 90:3,8,10 35:23 85:2 91:2 38:15 authority 32:20,23 81:8		35:23		30.13	

				3
91:3 authorized	10:12 backward	black 28:23 book 40:5	c	charge-back 9:23
81:20 auto 30:18,19	45:2 bad 55:1	books 11:18	cabinet 72:19 81:16 82:2	charges 35:11
automated 21:22 39:5 48:1,9,12 49:15 automatic 14:7 15:9 automatically	base 6:19 based 37:5 44:15 80:19 85:21 92:2,14 basic 6:20 basically 9:20 25:24	bottom 39:22 43:6 44:10, 11,13 85:1 Bowles 12:2 box 25:9 53:11 54:18 57:11	calendar 40:24 60:1 call 8:23 11:10,13 66:23 called 5:2 6:14 11:3	Charles 66:20 85:12 92:16,17,21 93:6,14,20 Charleston 10:16 check 60:10
27:11 48:5 availability 5:22	30:8 37:4 39:17,20 48:22 83:12	branch 7:10, 19,23 8:6,12	13:20 33:7 40:3 73:5,7,8, 9	65:3 81:15 checklists 91:9
average 23:24 Avis 56:11, 14,15,17 57:6 58:18 61:16, 21 62:12,15 63:8 64:3 65:22 76:12, 14 92:21 Avis's 61:18	basis 94:2 Bates 44:9,12 78:23 began 76:21 begin 42:9 Beth 24:2 26:3 44:5 80:17 81:8 Bible 40:4	brand 44:17 break 7:7 45:18 55:11 70:3,4 90:16, 18 break/fix 9:8 broad 77:17 brought 64:5 BROWN	calling 90:12 calls 94:5 cards 11:17 care 50:18 51:1 65:6,21 case 29:23 44:4 68:22 73:22 81:8 86:8 87:8	chief 5:14,24 18:5 85:12 choice 34:17 Chris 56:14, 17 57:6 58:6 61:15,16 92:21 CIO 18:5 73:5 circle 28:23
avoid 49:16 aware 85:14, 16 B back 10:11 11:3 14:16 35:11 39:12 47:14 61:3 66:24 75:8,20 76:7 92:18 background	big 82:10 biggest 8:6 Bill 24:4 32:14 73:9 86:19 89:6 billed 65:13 billing 9:11 bit 10:12 16:18 18:3 33:24 77:18 79:8	90:22 91:23 93:1 bucket 13:4 build 25:13 bulk 7:15 47:23 48:19, 24 49:4,6,7 bullet 47:15 bunch 44:18 business 9:20,22 10:14	cases 65:23 cc'd 88:13 cc's 88:18,19 center 7:18 certificates 10:20,21 chance 49:22 74:5 change 17:2 charge 35:2, 8,16,21,24 36:3	42:16,17 CISO 6:16 CISSP 10:21 clear 36:22 58:22 clock 59:8 close 14:13 37:1,3 closed 26:24 27:8,12,14 closes 39:9 closing 27:9

Cloud 31:13, 18 32:1,3,4 41:14 Coben 36:14 87:20 COBOL 11:14 45:11,12 code 9:5 collection 40:11,13 93:24 comment 25:14 59:9 comments 25:3 common 41:16 communicate d 73:3 complete 80:21 completed 27:13,18 completely 25:5 54:24	confuses 48:3 confusion 78:18 connect 9:21 consistent 83:15 consolidated 7:11 contact 69:20,23 80:10 contacts 80:4 contained 80:24 continue 55:6 continues 88:15 contract 57:5 contractor 58:2 control 15:13 20:1 conversation	correct 8:13 22:23 28:3,11 32:17 36:12 41:7 44:6 51:2 59:4 60:16 66:8,18 69:19 72:14 76:23 79:24 81:5 83:21,22 85:23 89:8 90:5 COS 57:10 cost 7:14 counsel's 82:7 couple 10:20 20:16 80:9 Court 5:3 19:5,8 cover 30:11 54:14 64:1 covered 91:10 COVID 86:7 Cox 5:1,7,12, 13 22:7 36:8	creating 83:17 84:17 creation 14:16 16:9 Crouch 73:8, 9 87:9 Crouch's 24:4 29:24 31:4 32:14 86:19 89:6 CSO 53:11,15 54:18 59:13 CTO 79:11 current 5:13 25:4 Customer 24:2 customized 33:10 cut 28:19 cyber 10:19 53:18	26:5,16,20,21 28:14 38:3 52:8,9,10 dated 78:23 87:18 dates 30:4 83:4 day 14:8 days 14:11 17:8,10,21 27:6 29:16,21 31:2,3 37:18 38:23 39:6,9 40:24 41:4 44:4 45:14,22 46:1,17 47:2, 20,21 49:19, 21 deadlines 38:19 deal 7:16 40:8 dealing 40:7 41:13 87:8 December 26:4 30:1
completing 66:2 compliance	76:16 93:19, 21 coordinate 33:21	41:20 51:18 60:18 78:3 82:13 87:15 90:15	DAA 32:19 80:11,12 81:8,14 82:1, 8 91:16	40:17 71:7 87:18 88:22 91:21 93:17 decides 24:8
6:21 20:1 components 8:20 computer 8:3 11:2 38:6 concluded 94:13	33:21 coordinates 55:21 copies 14:11 32:7,8 copy 63:17 copying 88:17	90:15 create 15:5 16:4 82:17 83:13,19 created 13:24 15:24 26:3,6, 15 27:7 42:21 49:11 84:20	DAA's 81:18 Danielle 5:1, 12 data 5:22 7:17 33:17 41:3 59:3 date 14:1	default 41:14 54:16 define 9:1 degree 10:17, 22 11:1 Delegating 44:1

				5
delegation 44:3 delete 47:22 48:4,19 49:3 50:24 52:4 53:6 59:16 deleted 17:11,24 37:10 48:5 60:9,13 deletion 45:15,19,21 46:3,7,12 48:24 49:1 91:14 department 5:16 6:6 7:12 8:15 12:10 15:17 18:2 28:13 33:5 44:15 departments 8:14 12:15 81:20 84:5 depending 54:11 55:17 depo 54:5,24 83:11 91:22 deposition 22:8 36:6,9, 16 39:15 41:21 43:12 44:5 51:19 53:10 60:19 63:7 65:17	20,23 80:2 81:2 82:14 86:15 87:5,16 89:24 93:8 94:13 deprovision 14:7 22:15,17 37:6 79:6 deprovisione d 16:20 23:18 38:23 90:10 deprovisionin g 16:17 21:16 24:7 25:16 28:10 36:11, 19,22,24 37:23 43:16 44:2 46:6 77:15 85:14 90:1 deprovisionin gs 80:16 describe 36:22 designate 85:2 designated 32:20 80:3,10 81:7 82:1 91:2 desk 43:10 61:6 destruction 85:17 86:10	determine 37:9 determining 59:7 DHHR 5:9 8:13 12:7,9 13:11,16 17:2 24:5 25:15 33:4,11,18 65:14 67:10 68:8,16,23 69:20 72:11, 24 74:19,22 75:15 76:10 81:13,23 83:23 84:4, 11,16,23 85:8 86:20 87:2 92:11 difference 48:18,23 49:6 differently 51:9 81:5 directly 18:22 19:2 61:15 director 12:1 57:22 directories 41:2 Disable 43:17 disabled 39:20,21 40:21,23,24 disabling	discussed 92:7 discussing 93:14 discussion 33:1 87:12 discussions 66:20 92:19 distinction 26:8 47:8 48:14,24 divisions 8:18,20 9:1 document 22:3,18 31:14 41:22 42:1 43:5,21 46:20 52:8,11 60:20,21,23 61:2 64:15 66:1,4,5 67:4, 5,7 70:21,24 76:22 77:1 78:8,22 82:16 87:21 91:20, 21 92:2,6,11, 18,23 documentatio n 31:18 68:23 74:18 85:22 documents 31:24 41:14 50:14 62:3 65:11 79:10 90:1 93:10	draft 82:19 drafted 82:20,22 draining 10:4 drive 31:15, 17,23 32:9,13 drops 14:4,5 dual 10:13 duly 5:2 dumb 88:7 E earlier 5:8 80:16 early 86:18 87:3 easier 77:19 easily 20:6 education 8:5 educational 10:12 effect 41:6 74:3 effective 26:20,21 28:14,17 38:2 eight-page 41:22 electronic 23:2
41:21 43:12 44:5 51:19 53:10 60:19	61:6 destruction	39:20,21 40:21,23,24	31:24 41:14 50:14 62:3 65:11 79:10	41:22 electronic
,	20.11			

				8
information 5:14 6:1,14, 17 11:7,12 13:23 14:2 15:6 18:5 27:20,23	investigator 54:6,19 55:13,17,21, 23 56:18 57:3,7,8,14	Jeremiah 72:3 Jim 56:9,10, 22 57:7 Josh 18:13,	lead 57:2,7,8, 9,13,15,22,23 58:9,10 leads 57:17, 19	list 27:15,18 52:23 81:11, 18,23 82:5,10 88:15 listed 75:22
38:12,14 54:7 55:18 59:1 61:10 85:12	investigators 56:2 66:2 issue 16:10	15,16 judicial 8:9	learned 11:14	listen 66:21 literally 59:24
infrastructure 20:3	52:9 83:4 issued 79:11	jumped 10:10 K	17:13,20 56:20 leaving 13:19	13:8 20:13 34:19 36:1
initial 49:12 initiated	84:7 issues 12:7 49:11 65:24	keeping 20:3	16:24 25:6 28:9	50:3,7,13,18 60:20 63:7, 10,18 64:4,9
60:13 input 24:9	71:18 item 75:21	kick 31:6 kicked 19:18	left 57:6 58:6 left-hand 27:19	65:16,20 70:8,19 71:7
inputted 27:24	Ivanti 13:21 22:14 43:10,	kind 9:20 45:3 48:13 81:17	legislative 8:9 9:4	72:6,10,17, 18,19 76:20 86:16 87:2,3
inside 32:12 instance 13:11	15 58:20 	Kirk 56:9,10, 22 57:1,7,23	Leroy 19:4 20:22,23,24 21:1 56:12	89:2 91:21 93:17 locate 70:7
instigated 60:12	Jacqueline 62:1,17,23	58:6,18 knew 69:3 86:1	61:20 Leroy's 20:7	locked 17:9
integrity 5:21 interaction 71:10	70:15 Janet 70:10	knowledge 41:16 71:3 75:12 85:13	letter 63:7,18 66:16 68:21 87:2,18 88:23	37:19,20 38:6 logged 38:20
internal 26:22 27:2,5,7,10 36:1 52:2	January 27:6 30:2 Jarrett 24:2,3	92:9	89:3 93:17,22 letters 68:15	Login/logout 59:5 logs 66:23
78:9,12 84:17 interpret 77:8	25:8 26:3 27:24 28:16 29:15,23	large 17:1	Level 43:7 license 37:2 39:10 45:20	long 5:24 6:8 11:2 18:8,18 20:18 21:8,10
investigation 51:13,20 52:2,3 74:9	30:22 32:21 44:6 80:17,20 81:9,14 82:3	23:22 largest 8:15 late 86:17	lied 78:16 Lifecycle	20:16 21:6,10 23:14 26:9 30:24 32:5 55:10 56:17
investigation s 20:9 35:6	Jarrett's 32:12	87:2 Laughs 21:9	42:4,6,8,11 light 67:1	57:23 81:23 86:3,4
36:1,2 61:8 94:1	Jeffrey 36:14 87:20	lawyers 77:7	lighter 83:6	longer 34:8 39:10 57:1,2

				9
looked 43:21 89:23 loop 61:17 lost 57:12 lot 8:7 54:14 59:7 65:10, 12,19 73:17 74:15 83:4,6 Lucky 12:4 21:13	64:23 management 7:17 9:6,17 10:14,18 13:2 14:24 15:1 21:19 24:16, 21 31:14 32:22 36:15 38:5 39:19 40:1 42:5,6,8 46:6 58:21 79:10	materials 91:4 maternity 17:13 Matt 19:4 matter 5:9 60:13 72:12, 13 matters 12:8 meaning 7:12	minor 11:7 MIS 33:8,9, 12,22 34:2,19 65:24 66:21 70:22 71:10 84:8,9,10,17, 20 85:10,13 missed 61:12 62:7 monitoring 12:11	55:18 56:13 64:2,12 66:3 needing 52:22 nerd 11:21 29:5 45:1 nerds 77:11 network 7:13 25:4 newly 85:5
made 19:21 mailbox 29:14,15 53:12,13,14, 24 54:1 main 8:14 24:4 maintain 34:15 maintaining 12:12 89:18, 21 major 10:13 make 10:2 16:2 55:8 65:15 77:5,18 91:8 makes 24:7 54:8 making 20:5	manager 6:5, 15 10:2 19:15 20:18 21:1 56:12 57:22 61:10,11,14, 16,18 managers 19:2,3,14 manner 51:10 manually 48:15 49:13 marked 22:6, 8 36:6,7,9 39:13,15 41:19,21 51:17,19 60:17,19 78:2,4,19,20 82:12,14 87:11,16 Marshall 10:18 massive	means 24:23 27:11 30:7 36:23 46:4 50:5 55:11 meet 83:9 meeting 92:5 member 38:5 mentioned 8:19 9:15 16:15,17 37:13 70:18 message 30:10,17 messages 30:11 met 5:8 Microsoft 31:19 41:15 43:2 middle 25:2 migrated 86:13	month 24:1 35:22 months 18:9, 10 morning 5:7 move 59:24 multiple 55:24 56:2 72:16 multiple-page 52:7 Mydrive 31:10,11,12, 21 32:6,14 Mydrives 34:11 N names 67:15 68:3 necessarily	nice 63:1 77:23 nods 28:12 59:11 Non- executive 7:23 notification 17:20 notified 16:19 notifying 37:22 number 16:23 22:9 23:12,22 29:12 36:6, 10,17 37:7 39:16 41:21 43:12 44:12 51:19 53:10 60:19 63:8 65:17 68:16 69:8 70:20 75:10 76:21
man 21:13 manage 33:14,16	65:20 master's 10:17 11:1	mine 9:3 57:21 mining 76:22	42:15 68:22 87:7 needed 13:23 47:16 54:12	78:5,21,22 79:1 81:3 82:14 83:11 86:16 87:5,16

- 1	(1

	2	r ·	V.	i)
91:22,23 93:8 numbers 44:9,11 78:24	open 27:14 61:8 65:23 94:1 operation	past 11:16 68:8 76:11 pay 9:23	71:18 85:21 plaintiffs 5:9 plan 33:18	PR-1001 74:5,14,20 practice 17:16 44:16
0	92:12	pentesting 20:5	planning 9:14 19:24	preservations
obligation 36:18	operations 9:7 15:2 20:10	people 10:7 19:1 25:11 65:8 68:19	plans 9:24 play 10:6	71:13 preserve 50:14 66:7
October 86:21,23 89:7	opposite 14:3 opt 35:20	78:15 88:13 percent 9:22	PMO 9:6,16	68:24 71:5,11 72:11 75:13
Offboarding/ termination	option 29:18	Perfect 80:1	PO 79:13 point 12:21	76:3 77:3 86:19 89:6,12
43:7 office 5:16	options 79:7 order 68:4	performing 25:11 75:1	20:11,15 46:11 48:11 64:4 66:22	preserved 66:17 71:23
6:9 7:1,2,3,4, 9 9:4,5,6,7,	OT 8:23 27:3 82:20	period 17:5 46:14 47:3	67:9 69:16 73:15 94:4,6	72:4,5,15 preserving
17,19 11:23 12:19,20 14:18 16:19 33:21 35:24	overarching 79:4	person 28:22 29:11 31:9 32:5 57:11	pole 35:15 policies	12:9 74:23 pretty 17:2 41:10,16 62:9
37:5,7 41:17	Р	91:10 person's	40:14 44:19 79:14 82:18,	66:24 67:3 68:13 70:24
37:5,7 41:17 53:9,18,22 54:2 64:8,16 66:6 67:10 69:10 70:13, 21 71:9 72:9 73:4,13 75:12,19 77:14,19 78:13,23 81:16 82:2,8 88:19,22 90:7 officer 5:14 6:1,14,17 18:5 85:13 one-on-one 91:6 Onedrive 31:13,19	paid 11:5 panel 47:22 49:4,6,10 paragraph 40:22 paralegal 70:12,17 parameters 27:20 part 15:2 40:2 48:3 77:2 78:17 91:14 passed 47:21 passwords 67:16,19,22	person's 29:10 30:19 31:10 32:9 60:1 perspective 64:19 66:11 92:3,14 phone 90:12 physical 37:18 physically 38:9 Picking 90:12 picks 24:18 pike 65:20 place 23:15 26:22 31:1	79:14 82:18, 21 83:13,17, 20,24 84:5, 18,21 85:4 policy 6:22 40:1 41:6,9 44:16 77:24 79:4,14,17,18 80:19,24 82:17,19 83:12 85:17, 20 86:11 pool 10:4 position 5:20 6:3 18:9,11, 19 56:7 PR 79:12 PR's 74:15	

-	-

-	~
- 1	

representatio n 83:16 request 13:21 15:4 22:15 23:11,20 24:11 25:2 26:5 28:8 29:17,18 34:8 36:11,16 37:6,15 38:16 46:18 47:5 50:13,19,21 51:14,20 58:16 59:14, 15 66:6 67:13 69:3 71:5,9	respond 30:13 responded 26:23 27:8 response 31:5 62:21 responsibiliti es 46:21 responsibility 48:10 responsible 5:21 13:17 19:23 20:12 21:15 48:12,	reviewing 85:4 reviews 60:15 revised 52:8 82:22 revision 52:10 rhyme 40:10 Rice 12:2 Rich 5:8 right-hand 24:19	Samples' 73:10 scans 20:5 screenshot 22:21 scripting 48:2 scripts 38:18 39:3,4 48:17 49:9 60:9,10 search 58:24 94:7 searches 13:5,6	select 29:11 send 34:7 46:5 47:5 67:12 75:20 76:7 sending 30:11 38:8 sense 54:8 sentence 43:24 47:13 separate 73:19 separated 71:22
24.11 25.2			~~.~	
1	31:5 62:21	82:22		sendina
26:5 28:8				_
29:17.18 34:8	responsibiliti	revision	48:2	30.1130.0
· '	es 46:21	52:10		sense 54:8
I '				
· '		rhyme 40:10	1 '	
1	48:10	Rice 12:2	49:9 60:9,10	43:24 47:13
1 '	responsible		search 58.24	senarate
1		Rich 5:8		· ·
	· ·	right-band	34.1	13.18
15 66:6 67:13		_	searches	separated
69:3 71:5,9	,	24.19	13:5.6	
72:11,17,24	16 85:3	Rights 87:19		_
73:20,21 74:1	rest 7:21	rials 60.4	searching	separately
75:3,5,13		risk 68:1	34:11	71:9
86:18 89:2,6	restored	Robertson	secret 85:22	separation
00.10 09.2,0	45:16	74:1 92:10		16:22 40:21
requested	result 89:3		secretaries	10.22 40.21
14:14 15:21		Robertson's	16:13	sequential
38:12	93:21	70:13	a a a reate mar	23:12
	retained 60:3,	role 5:20 6:18	secretary	00 47
requesting	5		72:19	series 38:17
51:5 52:1,18		33:9	secretary's	Server 7:17
requests	retention	ROSS 11:20	81:16 82:2	
22:17 24:7	59:23 70:22	35:13 63:2		servers 8:3
	71:1	94:12	section 43:6	service 7:9
36:2 50:4,11			52:21,23	8:16 9:23,24
52:3 68:7	retires 21:11	Rotating	59:23 62:13	The state of the s
73:19 75:1	retrieval	89:18		22:14 23:11,
89:12	76:23 77:1	rulos EE:4	security 5:14,	14,20 24:14
required 27.0	·	rules 55:4	22 6:5,14	25:2 26:1,5
required 37:8	return 44:17	run 38:18	7:13 10:19	36:11 43:10
54:15 83:20	69:11,21		17:16 19:23,	48:21
requirement	returns 44:14	running 20:4	24 20:9 25:10	services
36:18			35:12,20	
	45:14	s	40:22 53:18	6:23,24 7:12,
resourced	review 61:8		68:1 77:15	16 9:10,12
10:3,4	83:21	Samples		11:8 26:23
resources		72:3,23	sees 14:9	27:5,7,10
	reviewed	12.3,23	54:6,7	set 9:3 15:8,
10:5 39:12	92:7			3CL 3.3 13.0,
	9			1/

-	_
- 1	

		14
technical 47:7 48:14 51:20 64:19, 22 66:11 67:6 89:9 92:3,13 technically 48:8 64:11 92:12 technician 26:24 technicians 14:6 50:23 78:10 technology 5:16 6:9 7:1,2 9:21 10:18 11:23 12:3 41:18 64:16 66:7 67:11 78:14 telling 67:13 68:17 tells 64:15 65:5 66:16 81:19 temp 57:5 ten 14:8 19:1, 20 76:3 technical 47:7 48:14 theoretically 31:24 theoretically 31:24 today 12:7 toggle 38:8 told 28:15 51:23 57:10 83:12 tool 43:3 top 23:11 40:20 45:13 40:20 45:13 40:20 45:13 40:20 45:13 topic 40:7 topics 91:10 touching 35:14 trained 80:20 91:11 training 12:1 77:13,20 80:4 86:9,12 91:1, 34:91 transferring 16:24 25:5 transmitted 39:1	37:24 43:17, 18 true 14:3 turn 88:1,3 Turnovers 23:24 two-page 22:21 type 6:23 9:8, 10,11 16:12 30:19 33:19 52:17 77:13 typed 25:7 30:22 types 65:10 typically 6:20 12:18 13:5 24:7 38:11 49:7 51:15 52:20 55:21 56:3 69:10 91:5 U UC 10:23 11:3,5 Uh-huh 18:17 30:23 37:16 41:1 54:20 76:15 underappreciated 78:1 underneath 19:15	45:9 46:20 54:13 65:15 81:12 understandin g 39:7 50:2 63:6 71:20 Understood 83:7 University 10:16 up-to-date 20:4 update 42:23 updated 43:1 user 35:21,22 37:2 44:14 45:14 49:12 53:3,5 59:24 user's 25:4 33:16 users 21:23 44:17 47:19 V Vault 59:23 verify 38:13 version 31:13,14 43:1 versus 49:1, 15 view 37:8 Virginia 5:18 6:9 7:1,11 78:13 87:19

volume 49:18	19:22	36:10
vulnerability	wit 5:4	:
20:4	word 17:5,23	Υ
W	42:14 worded 81:5	year 71:8,13 73:24 83:1
wait 55:8 78:16	words 93:18 work 6:20	86:18 89:7, 11,14,15,17 years 6:10
walk 6:11 23:10 37:14	9:20 11:3,22, 24 12:17,18, 19 13:20 15:9	18:20 21:2,11 23:16,18 41:7
walking 16:16	27:15,18 30:12 33:21	51:9 56:19 58:1 85:21 86:7
Walters 5:6,8 33:3 63:3 70:1,5 87:14 90:15,19	35:5 44:14 65:11,12,19, 22 81:12 82:24 worked 51:6	your-all's 57:21
91:22 93:4 94:10		
wanted 34:2 42:14 67:10	working 25:15	
71:19 90:14 91:8	works 13:11 85:14	
ways 49:3	world 41:18	
website 79:2	writes 84:3	
weekly 61:8	writing 6:22 77:24	
weird 47:7		
West 5:18 6:9 7:1,11 78:13	written 72:23 91:4	
87:19 whatnot	wrong 49:12 77:12	
49:13	WVOT 8:21,	
whichever 54:10 Winfree 19:4,	23 23:8 39:16 41:23 76:11, 19 80:4,20	
11,12	86:9 91:3 WVOT's 77:2	
Winfree's	WVOTDOCS	